

IMPACT STUDY

the EFFECTS of FACILITATED SINGLE-VISIT ART MUSEUM PROGRAMS on STUDENTS GRADES 4-6



APPENDIX

Prepared for the National Art Education Association & Association of Art Museum Directors

TABLE OF CONTENTS

METHODOLOGY	4
SAMPLE SELECTION	4
PILOT STUDY	10
PROGRAM OBSERVATIONS	11
PROGRAM OBSERVATION GUIDE	11
PROGRAM OBSERVATION TRAINING EXAMPLES	16
PROGRAM OBSERVATION FINDINGS: SUPPLEMENTAL INFORMATION	20
STUDENT QUESTIONNAIRES	23
STUDENT QUESTIONNAIRE – PRE (UNFORMATTED)	23
STUDENT QUESTIONNAIRE – POST (UNFORMATTED)	25
ASSENT FORM	29
PARENT PERMISSION FORM	31
STUDENT INTERVIEWS	34
ASSENT FORM	36
PARENT PERMISSION FORM	38
ANALYTICAL TOOL	41
STUDENT INTERVIEW FINDINGS: SUPPLEMENTAL INFORMATION	53
TEACHER QUESTIONNAIRE	54
TEACHER QUESTIONNAIRE	54
CONSENT FORM (FOR QUESTIONNAIRE AND INTERVIEW)	56
TEACHER QUESTIONNAIRE FINDINGS: SUPPLEMENTAL INFORMATION	59
TEACHER INTERVIEWS	63
TEACHER INTERVIEW GUIDES	63
CONSENT FORM	66

MUSEUM FACILITATOR INTERVIEWS	67
MUSEUM FACILITATOR INTERVIEW GUIDE	67
CONSENT FORM	68

*Cover photo taken by Amanda Krantz at the Orlando Museum of Art

METHODOLOGY

RK&A conducted a quasi-experimental study that employed three study groups: Treatment A (museum program), Treatment B (classroom program), and Control (no museum or classroom program). Students from all six museum partners were distributed across these six groups.

SAMPLE SELECTION

MUSEUM PARTNERS

As noted in the technical report, museum partners were selected by applying a specific set of criteria to the state of the field survey results. The criteria were agreed upon by RK&A, NAEA, and AAMD to focus the study on a specific type of single-visit program as well as a specific student population. Please also note:

- NAEA core team members' museums were not considered
- Initially, the Norman Rockwell Museum in Massachusetts was the New England museum selected. However, while the museum was interested in participating, the primary districts that the museum works with did not want to participate in the study, Thus, we had to replace them with the Rhode Island School of Design Museum another museum who had met the required criteria.

Museum partners voluntarily committed to this project (to which we are exceedingly grateful). The commitment to the study came with the request for each museum to serve approximately 750 students in grades 4, 5, and 6 whom we will designate into one of three study groups:

	Treatment Group A	Treatment Group B	Control Group
Intervention/ Museum Offering	Single-visit <u>museum</u> program facilitated by a museum educator or docent	Single-visit <u>classroom</u> program offered by a museum educator or docent	No intervention
Number of Students Served*	Approximately 250 students (10-15 classrooms)	Approximately 250 students (10-15 classrooms)	Approximately 250 students (10-15 classrooms)

^{*}We intend for about one-third of the students in each study group to be in grade 4, one-third in grade 5, and one-third in grade 6.

To participate in the research, the partner museum agreed to:

- 1. Provide the research team with a list of schools from pre-determined school districts that enroll 4th, 5th, and 6th grade students and regularly participate in the museum's school programs. We will use the lists to inform our selection of potential schools; our goal is to achieve equity across study groups. The list of schools does not guarantee a school's inclusion in the study or limit the study to those on the list.
- Schedule and provide programs to the above-mentioned study groups as follows: **Treatment Group A** - The museum will schedule single-visit <u>museum</u> programs for approximately 250 students in grades 4, 5, and 6 from a pre-identified school district (or districts). Further, the museum will provide gallery access to research team members so they can conduct observation of each program; researchers will not interact with school group members or program facilitators in any way during the program experience. For the purposes of the study, these programs will adhere to the following parameters:
 - Study programs will take place between January 2017 and May 2017. The museum will give all study group classrooms priority in scheduling.
 - The museum will not provide participating students with pre-visit outreach experiences (school visits).
 - The programs will not include a studio/artmaking component.
 - All programs will be free for participating schools.

Treatment Group B - The museum will schedule single-visit, <u>classroom</u> programs for approximately 250 students in grades 4, 5, and 6 from a pre-identified school district (or districts). Two researchers will observe all classroom programs; researchers will not interact with students or program facilitators during the classroom programs. For the purposes of the study, these classroom programs will adhere to the following parameters:

- The classroom program will mimic the museum program offered to Treatment Group A; the facilitator will show reproductions of works of art (printed or digitally projected) in the classroom.
- Each program will be limited to a single classroom of students; additional students will not attend the programs. However, the museum may schedule additional programs in the school building on the same day.
- The program will not include a studio/artmaking component.
- All classroom presentations will be offered to schools for free.
- The museum will offer Treatment Group B teachers and students a free program at the museum to be scheduled on a later date—after classes complete their participation in the study. Schools may accept or decline the offer for a post-study museum program.

Control Group - This group of approximately 250 students from the same district(s) will not receive any interventions during the study period. As with Treatment Group B students and teachers, the museum will offer Control Group students and teachers a free museum program to be scheduled on a later date—after classes complete their participation in the study. Schools may accept or decline the offer for a post-study museum program.

- 3. Support the research initiative's NAEA project manager with communications and correspondence with local participating school district(s) and schools as needed.
- Update the NAEA project manager with program scheduling changes or cancellations as soon as they occur.

In return, the Research Team agreed to:

- 1. Conduct and oversee all study activities, including:
 - Identifying participating school districts and securing IRB and school district approvals to conduct the study.
 - Assuming primary responsibility for
 - Distributing, collecting, and managing study-related paperwork including, school letters of agreement, parental permission, teacher consent, and student assent forms.
 - Scheduling data collection with schools.
 - Observing the study programs, conducting student interviews, and distributing and collecting questionnaire data.
 - Analyzing data and creating a comprehensive final report of key findings across all research sites.
 - Disseminating study results through multiple outlets and venues including a comprehensive final report, companion User's Guide to the report, conference and convention sessions, research symposium, publication submissions, and other formats.
- 2. Provide study-related benefits to each museum site, including:
 - Supplying each museum site with up to \$2,000 in grant funds, to be used as they see fit to offset expenses directly resulting from study activities (e.g., serving a higher number of students through the program, hiring additional educators for museum and/or classroom programs, reimbursing mileage expenses for classroom programs, creating reproductions of artworks).
 - Giving staff at all museum sites early access to the study's Literature Review.
 - Hosting a series of webinar orientations for relevant museum staff with detailed information about the study's logistics and procedures in advance of data collection.

• Compiling individual reports for each participating museum in addition to reporting comprehensive findings across all sites.

SCHOOL PARTNERS

RK&A and the NAEA Project Managers secured permissions to work with seven school districts. We have not identified the school districts or schools by name, but below are some descriptive details by museum partner, which are also not identified by name. Please note that data were secured in the summer to fall of 2016 from www.greatschools.org.

MUSEUM A

Two school districts served by this partner museum participated in the study. Both districts allowed passive consent for the student questionnaire. That is, parents or guardians were sent an information sheet with opt out information but were not required to return a signed permission form. Below are data on the eight schools engaged from the two districts (four schools from each district). Note that two middle schools had classrooms split among study groups.

Study Group	School	GreatSchools.org rating ¹	SchoolGrades.org rating ²	Free/reduced lunch %	ELL %
Treatment A	Α	3	С	83	Data unavailable
Treatment A	В	3	D	85	Data unavailable
Treatment A	С	3	С	87	Data unavailable
Treatment B	D	4	D	78	Data unavailable
Control	E	3	В	74	Data unavailable
Control	F	3	D	75	Data unavailable
Mix of Treatment A & Control	G	5	F	65	Data unavailable
Mix of Treatment A, Treatment B, & Control	Н	2	D	87	Data unavailable

¹ Ratings are on a scale from 1 to 10, where 10 is most favorable and 1 least favorable. Please see the following for additional information: https://www.greatschools.org/gk/ratings/

² Ratings are on a scale from A to F, where A is most favorable and F least favorable. Please see the following for additional information: https://www.schoolgrades.org/methodology

MUSEUM B

One school district served by this partner museum participated in the study. This district also allowed passive consent for the student questionnaire. Notice that classrooms at one school, a middle school, were split among study groups.

Study Group	School	GreatSchools.org rating	SchoolGrades.org rating	Free/reduced lunch %	ELL %
Treatment A	Α	8	В	100	10
Treatment A	В	3	С	100	6
Treatment A	С	6	С	60	13
Treatment B	D	9	Α	38	
Treatment B	E	5	В	100	24
Control	F	2	D	78	12
Control	G	4	С	100	22
Mix of Treatment A,	Н	8	В	62	4
Treatment B, &					
Control					

MUSEUM C

One district served by this partner museum participated in the study. Note that a second district was approached to participate, but they rejected the research request.

Study Group	School	GreatSchools.org	SchoolGrades.org	Free/reduced	ELL %
		rating	rating	lunch %	
Treatment A	Α	4	В	93	Data unavailable
Treatment A	В	2	D	92	Data unavailable
Treatment A	С	3	D	78	Data unavailable
Treatment B	D	2	D	89	Data unavailable
Treatment B	E	4	В	89	Data unavailable
Treatment B	F	2	D	72	Data unavailable
Control	G	3	D	99	Data unavailable

MUSEUM D

One district served by this partner museum participated in the study.

Study Group	School	GreatSchools.org	SchoolGrades.org	Free/reduced	ELL %
		rating	rating	lunch %	
Treatment A	Α	6	D	85	Data unavailable
Treatment A	В	4	С	59	Data unavailable
Treatment A	С	2	F	88	Data unavailable
Treatment B	D	4	F	79	Data unavailable
Control	E	3	D	81	Data unavailable
Control	F	3	D	63	Data unavailable

MUSEUM E

One district served by this partner museum participated in the study.

one distinct served	the district served by this partner museum partner partner in the study.				
Study Group	School	GreatSchools.org	SchoolGrades.org	Free/reduced	ELL %
		rating	rating	lunch %	
Treatment A	Α	5	D	69	24
Treatment A	В	6	С	57	16
Treatment A	С	4	D	82	20
Control	D	5	D	61	15
Mix of Treatment A,	E	7	С	65	8
Treatment B, &					
Control					

MUSEUM F

One district served by this partner museum participated in the study.

Study Group	School	GreatSchools.org rating	SchoolGrades.org rating	Free/reduced lunch %	ELL %
Treatment A	Α	7	Α	50	26
Treatment B	В	3	С	95	40
Control	С	4	D	75	2

RECRUITING INDIVIDUAL SCHOOLS

Please note that RK&A and the NAEA Project Manager encountered many difficulties in securing permissions from individual schools after receiving the permissions from the school districts. The primary factor is that, while the programs were being offered for free, this was not incentive enough for schools to sign onto the study. The NAEA Project Director and Manager, however, were able to secure additional funding from the Institute of Museum and Library Services (IMLS) to cover transportation expenses for schools to the museum. This additional funding was critical for being able to secure enough schools for the sample, including schools that did not have a pre-existing relationship with the museum.

PILOT STUDY

Mentioned only in passing in the technical report, please note that prior to commencing data collection, a pilot study was conducted with partner Museum C in the spring of 2016. As part of the pilot study:

- RK&A observed six museum programs for grade levels 3-6. As a result, we determined to focus the study on grades 4-6. We also began operationalizing the teaching practices we consider to support the student capacities being explored in this study.
- RK&A interviewed students to test the interview guide and select the work of art to show students in the study. As a result of the testing, RK&A refined the wording of several interview questions and selected the Marc Chagall The Red Rooster image over other options, including Diego Rivera's Mother and Child Sleeping, Edouard Manet's The Old Musician, and a different Chagall, The Watering Trough.
- RK&A administered the questionnaire to 126 students. Some questionnaires were administered by RK&A and others by the teacher. As a result, RK&A refined some of the questionnaire wording and reordered the statements. RK&A also opted for a researcher-led administration protocol versus a teacher-led.
- RK&A also collected 6 teacher questionnaires. This informed the efficacy of the administration protocol.

Note that observations were conducted of public and private schools. However, RK&A was unable to secure permissions from a public school district in time for the interviews and questionnaires so these were done with private or parochial school students with permission from the school principals.

Pilot study results and the adjustments were discussed with the Core Team and Advisory Group in the summer of 2016 prior to engaging school districts for the full study.

PROGRAM OBSERVATIONS

PROGRAM OBSERVATION GUIDE

The following is a draft observation guide that was formatted for completion on Google Forms.

BACKGROUND			
Museum Name			
Date & Time			
Data Collector			
Location		☐ Museum	
		☐ School	
SMALL GROUP C	HARACTERIST	rics	
Grade Level			
Facilitator		□ Docent	
		☐ Staff	
Small Group Obs	erved	# Students in small group observed:	
		# Adults (other than facilitator):	
PROGRAM TIME	INE		
Entry	Start Time:		
experience	Stop Time:		
(from arrival to	Components:		
embarking on	☐ Review museum rules		
tour)	☐ Identify t	heme/type of works of art	
	☐ Identify g	goals for the visit	
	☐ Invite/en	courage them to visit the museum again	
	□ Othor:		

	T					
Program	Start Time:					
summary	Stop Time:					
(do not count						
informal/quick	Number of works of art viewed by whole group:					
stops outside						
the official	Work(s) of art/artist:					
program)	1					
	2					
	3					
	4					
	5					
	6					
	7					
	8					
	9					
	10					
	10					
	Number of times group split into small groups/individuals to look at works of art:					
	Activity type: ☐ Asks open-ended questions					
	□ Provides writing activity					
	☐ Provides sketching activity					
	☐ Asks students to role play/pose like a figure					
	☐ Invites/encourages students to visit museum again					
	☐ Uses a prop					
	1					
Conclusion	Other:					
	Start Time:					
(wrap-up conversation to	Stop Time:					
educators	Components:					
splitting from	Ask students reflection questions					
school group)	☐ Thank/compliment students					
8 ,	☐ Invite/encourage them to visit the museum again					
	Other:					
Notes about						
tour (e.g., late						
start, crowded						
galleries, etc)						
Photos of	☐ Uploaded and renamed with standardized format					
unusual						
occurrences						

BEST PRACTICE TEACHING BEHAVIORS					
umber on scale and provide up to 5 examples)					
Weak 1 2 3 4 5 6 7 Strong					
Examples:					
Weak 1 2 3 4 5 6 7 Strong					
Examples:					
Weak 1 2 3 4 5 6 7 Strong					
Examples:					
Weak 1 2 3 4 5 6 7 Strong					
Examples:					
Weak 1 2 3 4 5 6 7 Strong					
Examples:					
Weak 1 2 3 4 5 6 7 Strong					
Examples:					
u					

TEACHING BEHAVIORS THAT SUPP	PORT STUDENT CAPACITIES
1. Critical Thinking (Circle one nur	nber on scale and provide up to 5 examples)
Facilitator helps students to observe/look closely	Weak 1 2 3 4 5 6 7 Strong
Facilitator helps students to describe what they see	Weak 1 2 3 4 5 6 7 Strong Evamples:
Facilitator helps students connect observations to previous knowledge	Examples: Weak 1 2 3 4 5 6 7 Strong Examples:
Facilitator helps students to interpret visual images, speculate, and draw conclusions	Weak 1 2 3 4 5 6 7 Strong Examples:
Facilitator helps students recognize there are many ways to interpret the world	Weak 1 2 3 4 5 6 7 Strong Examples:
2. Creative Thinking (Circle one nu	umber on scale and provide up to 5 examples)
Facilitator helps students to question and investigate	Weak 1 2 3 4 5 6 7 Strong Examples:
Facilitator helps students envision alternative possibilities (different ways of seeing and responding)	Weak 1 2 3 4 5 6 7 Strong Examples:
Facilitator helps students gain comfort with ambiguity, complexity, the unknown	Weak 1 2 3 4 5 6 7 Strong Examples:
	(Circle one number on scale and provide up to 5 examples)
Facilitator helps students experience a heightened perceptual, kinesthetic, or emotional response to objects/museum spaces	Weak 1 2 3 4 5 6 7 Strong Examples:
Facilitator helps students experience <u>captivation</u> , <u>absorption</u> , <u>sustained attention</u>	Weak 1 2 3 4 5 6 7 Strong Examples:
Facilitator helps students experience <u>a sense of</u> wonder/awe ("redirection from the self toward everything else")	Weak 1 2 3 4 5 6 7 Strong Examples:

4. Human Connections (Circle one number on scale and provide up to 5 examples)			
Facilitator helps students connect to human experiences across culture, time, and place	Weak 1 2 3 4 5 6 7 Strong Examples:		
Facilitator helps students to make a personal connection to artworks/objects or their makers	Weak 1 2 3 4 5 6 7 Strong Examples:		
Facilitator helps students deepen/broaden their sense of self in their community (e.g. school, city)	Weak 1 2 3 4 5 6 7 Strong Examples:		
5. Academic Connections (Circle o	ne number on scale and provide up to 5 examples)		
Facilitator helps students to apply classroom knowledge (vocabulary, concepts, etc.) in a new context	Weak 1 2 3 4 5 6 7 Strong Examples:		

PROGRAM OBSERVATION TRAINING EXAMPLES

BEST PRACTICE TE	ACHING BEHAVIORS
The educator is open and attentive	 Nods in acknowledgement when listening to students Body language is open (e.g., turns his/her body towards students when they are speaking, Not standing with arms crossed) Makes eye contact with students Sits with students if they sit in front of a work of art (may sit in a chair versus on the floor) "Reads" students' behaviors and responds accordingly (e.g., if students appear bored, switch gears to engage them)
The educator is enthusiastic	 Smiles Expresses excitement for what they are looking at (e.g., "I love this one!") Expresses excitement for students' responses (e.g., "Wow! You just gave me an idea for artwork. I could make a 2D work that spins. Cool!")
The educator validates students	 Repeats students' questions or responses aloud Is open to divergent conclusions/does not tell student interpretation is wrong Acknowledges student thoughtfulness (e.g., "That is a great question. I like that you are referencing other works in the gallery.")
The educator checks for understanding/ knowledge	 Asks whether students have seen anything like this before/are familiar with a term Asks students whether they have questions before going on to another topic Senses confusion (e.g., no responses) and tries to fill gaps in knowledge
The educator asks open-ended questions/uses inquiry	 Asks a question that encourages a descriptive response, such as "What do you see?" or "What do you think is happening in this painting?" Asks a question that invites a variety of responses/not something that can be answered with a yes/no or single word response
The educator allows program content to emerge organically/ evolve from group dialogue	 Asks questions in response to student responses Allows conversation to be directed by the student versus to a specific end-goal Allows students to visit/discuss other works of art of their choosing

TEACHING BEHAVI	ORS THAT SUPPORT STUDENT CAPACITIES ³
1. Critical Thinking	
Facilitator helps students to observe/look closely	 Gives at least 20 seconds for students to look at a work of art before asking questions. Directs students to look in general (e.g., F: "Take a moment to look closely at this work of art.") Directs students to look at something specifically (e.g., F: "Let's look at these two figures [in a painting with multiple figures]. They are really interesting.") Provides strategies for or models how to look closely (e.g., F: "I'd like you to observe this painting closely. I want you to look all over. You may want to get close to see the details, and step back to take it all in.")
Facilitator helps students to describe what they see	 Asks students to describe (e.g., F: "Tell me, what do you see?" or F: "What else did you notice? or F: "What do you see that makes you say that?") Provides examples (e.g., F: "When you describe, tell me about all the details you see, like colors and textures. Pretend I can't see it") Models description: (e.g., F: "I see a red cloak. What do you see?")
Facilitator helps students connect observations to previous knowledge	 Directs or asks students to think about one thing in relation to something else seen or discussed (e.g., F: "Think about how that is similar to or different from what we saw previously." or F:"Does this figure look like any others we have seen today?" or "How does this object relate to other objects we've seen in this gallery?") Acknowledges importance of using prior knowledge (e.g., F: "You all have a lot of experience and knowledge that you bring into the museum. That information can help you make sense of works of art.") Models making connections (e.g., F: "This reminds me of a story in a children's book I would read to my grandchild")
Facilitator helps students to interpret visual images, speculate, and draw conclusions	 Directs students to interpret (e.g., F: "Works of art have clues to help us figure them out. First look at the work of art and make observations. Then think about what that means.") Asks students interpretive questions (e.g., F: "What do you think is happening in this scene?" or "Why do you think that is?" or F: "You are the artist. [Stands student in front of work of art] How do you paint this all the way at the top? Look at the painting it has clues" S: a ladder [F then describes drips and running of paint as suggestions for why he likely used a ladder versus laying painting flat]" Models interpretation: (e.g., F: "Look beyond the picture [a portrait]. Maybe she is going to a party [to explain her outfit]. Maybe she is mad [to explain her facial expression." or F: "I thought this might be the man's wife since she is helping him put the basket on his back and looks about his age")

³ F = Facilitator, S = Student

Facilitator helps students recognize there are many ways to interpret the world	 Acknowledges that there are no right or wrong answers (e.g., F: "Take a moment to think about what this boy may be feeling. There are no right or wrong answers." or F: "There are many different versions of this story that are all valid.") Models recognition of multiple interpretation: (e.g., F: "I want to hear what you think. It gives me new perspectives when I hear other's ideas.")
2. Creative Thinking	ng
Facilitator helps students to question and investigate	 When student asks a question about what the work means, the facilitator directs them to find an answer in the work of art (e.g., S: "What is this black thing?" F: Are there other clues to help you figure that out?"). Asks students questions to pose other curiosities (e.g., F: "What else do you want to know about this work of art?" or F: "What questions do you have about this work of art?") Models questioning and investigation: (e.g., F: "I have always wondered about this figure in the corner? What is his relationship to the group?")
Facilitator helps students envision alternative possibilities (different ways of seeing and responding)	 Asks students to place themselves in a scenario and consider different ways of seeing or responding (e.g., F: "Imagine you were the artist. What choices might you have made about the composition?" or "Why might someone want a piece of art like this in their house?") Challenges students to come up with an alternate possibility after s/he provides one (e.g., F: "That is an interesting thought. What else might this character be thinking?") Acknowledges a current condition and challenges students to think of other possibilities (e.g., "This is here in the museum now, but how might this artifact have been used originally?")
Facilitator helps students gain comfort with ambiguity, complexity, the unknown	 Acknowledges that it is okay not to know everything (e.g., F: "We can wonder about something without knowing the answer.") Points out ambiguous, complex, or unknown things (e.g., F: "Some people think that is hair, and some people don't.") Models comfort with ambiguity, complexity and the unknown (e.g., F: "This work is really complicated but that can be fun to explore.")
3. Sensorial & Affe	ective Responses
Facilitator helps students experience a heightened perceptual, kinesthetic, or emotional response to	 Asks students to do something kinesthetic/physical: (e.g., F: "Pose like the figure in this object. Does it change what you think or how you feel about the object?" or F: "Sometimes the best way to understand what is going on is to put yourself in that position." [Students pose like figure in artwork]) Directs students to open their senses (e.g., We are going to see a few specific works of art, but in the art museum there is art everywhere so keep your eyes peeled! My favorite is the ceiling by the stairway.") Models emotional response for students (e.g., "This is one of my favorite spots in the museum. It feels very safe and relaying.")

spots in the museum. It feels very safe and relaxing.")

<u>spaces</u>

objects/museum

Facilitator helps students experience captivation, absorption, sustained attention	 Gives students time to become absorbed (20 seconds or more). Provides an activity that encourages captivation, such as a sketching activity where students look closely at an object and sketch out its details. Acknowledges personal captivation (e.g., F: "You know, I once sat in front of this work for 30 minutes!")
Facilitator helps students experience a sense of wonder/awe ("redirection from the self toward everything else")	 Provides exposure to a work of art or an activity designed to elicit awe [need student evidence to know whether it works] (e.g., Facilitator provides students a worksheet with clues to help them find a painting. One clue is about being made with an unusual technique. Students look finally arrive at Chuck Close portrait made entirely of fingerprints and yell "Oh!! Fingerprints!" or F: "Some people think this piece is boring but you just have to be patient with it. Let's sit here together for a while." [after 1 minute] S: "Cool! It looks like it just changed colors!") Models awe (e.g., "Wow, this object always strikes me with its beauty.")
4. Human Connect	tions
Facilitator helps students connect to human experiences across culture, time, and place Facilitator helps students to make a personal connection to	 Asks students to place themselves in another culture, time, place (e.g., F: "Take a moment to imagine you were the boy in this painting.") Asks students to compare/contrast human experiences (e.g., "How do you think her life might be different than your own?" or "Do you think this Roman tablet with writing is similar to how you would write a letter today? How is it different?") Asks students to self-reflect (e.g., F: "Does anything you see remind you of something in your life?" or "If this object was in your house, where would it be?")
artworks/objects or their makers Facilitator helps students deepen/ broaden their	 Identifies local connections: (e.g., F: "Did you know this artist is from our city?" or [in reference to student works of art] "These were made by other students your age from other local schools.")
sense of self in their community (e.g. school, city)	Asks students to think about what they see in relation to their community
5. Academic Conn	
Facilitator helps students to apply classroom knowledge in a new context	 Makes explicit reference to what they have learned (e.g., F: "You've been learning about archaeology in your class. This mosaic was excavated by archaeologist in Turkey." or "I hear you are learning about Greek mythology in school. That will help you understand what we look at today." Asks students what they have learned in school. (e.g., This work is about the underground railroad. What have you learned in school about that?")

PROGRAM OBSERVATION FINDINGS: SUPPLEMENTAL INFORMATION

DATA REFERENCED BUT NOT REPORTED IN TECHNICAL REPORT

CONTEXT	% of observations		
Month	Museum (<i>n</i> = 66)	Classroom (n = 35)	Total (n = 101)
February	27	43	33
March	26	46	33
April	12	11	12
May	35	0	23
	Museum	Classroom	Total
Time of day	(n = 66)	(n = 35)	(n = 101)
Morning	73	77	74
Afternoon	27	23	26

CLASS CHARACTERISTICS

Grade level		% of observations		
	Museum (<i>n</i> = 66)	Classroom (<i>n</i> = 35)	Total (n = 101)	
4 th grade	26	43	32	
5 th grade	50	43	49	
6 th grade	24	14	22	

	Museum	Classroom	Total
Group size (per one facilitator)	(n = 66)	(n = 35)	(n = 101)
1 to 5 students	14	0	9
6 to 10 students	35	0	23
11 to 15 students	39	17	32
16 or more students	12	83	37

Number of adults	Museum (n = 66)	Classroom (<i>n</i> = 35)	Total (n = 101)
0 adults	15	17	16
1 adult	58	57	57
2 adults	23	14	20
3 adults	5	11	7

PROGRAM LENGTH

	% of observations		
Total time spent	Museum (<i>n</i> = 66)	Classroom (<i>n</i> = 35)	Total (n = 101)
30 minutes or less	2	6	3
31 to 60 minutes	20	60	34
61 to 90 minutes	62	31	51
91 minutes or more	17	3	13

NUMBER OF WORKS OF ART VIEWED

	% of observations		
Number of works of art	Museum (<i>n</i> = 66)	Classroom (<i>n</i> = 35)	Total (n = 101)
1-3 work(s) of art	6	49	20
4-5 works of art	35	6	25
6-9 works of art	14	11	13
10 or more works of art	45	34	42

Components	Museum (<i>n</i> = 66)	Classroom (<i>n</i> = 35)	Total (<i>n</i> = 101)
Asks open-ended questions	95	94	96
Uses a prop	41	57	47
Writing activity	33	46	38
Role play/posing*	39	14	31
Sketching activity	23	29	25
Engaging in narrative/storytelling	6	9	7
Offering opinion/rating	1	11	5
Looking at different perspective	6	0	4
Other	1	3	2

STUDENT QUESTIONNAIRES

STUDENT QUESTIONNAIRE - PRE (UNFORMATTED)

1. The statements below are about works of art that you might see in a museum. For each statement, circle one number that best describes how you feel.

		Strongly disagree	Somewhat disagree	Somewhat agree	Strongly agree
a.	I feel amazed when I look at works of art.	1	2	3	4
b.	Works of art should not be confusing.	1	2	3	4
c.	Things I have learned in school can help me understand works of art.	1	2	3	4
d.	Works of art have clues to help me understand what they mean.	1	2	3	4
e.	Works of art can help me understand what life was like in another time or place.	1	2	3	4
f.	Works of art are not related to my school work.	1	2	3	4
g.	I can learn about my classmates by listening to them talk about a work of art.	1	2	3	4
h.	All people should understand a work of art in the same way.	1	2	3	4
i.	Works of art help me imagine what life is like for someone else.	1	2	3	4
j.	When I look at works of art, I use what I already know to understand it.	1	2	3	4
k.	I feel strong emotions when I look at works of art.	1	2	3	4
ı.	When I look at works of art, I feel bored.	1	2	3	4
m.	Looking at works of art can give me new ideas.	1	2	3	4
n.	Works of art that are complicated make me curious.	1	2	3	4
0.	Works of art help me see something familiar in a completely new way.	1	2	3	4

	р.	best to have someone tell me.	1	2	3	4
	q.	Looking at works of art can help me be a better student.	1	2	3	4
	r.	Works of art can help me understand myself better.	1	2	3	4
	s.	I can lose track of time when looking at works of art.	1	2	3	4
	t.	Talking about works of art can help me understand things I learn in school.	1	2	3	4
2.	 Please check the one choice that best describes how you feel about art museums. Please be honest in your choice. Good Bored Fascinated Uncomfortable 					
3		ave you ever visited an art museum with <u>your sch</u> □ Yes □ No □ Not Sure	<u>100l</u> ?			
4		ave you ever visited an art museum <u>outside of scl</u> ☐ Yes ☐ No ☐ Not Sure	nool?			
5	<u>tv</u>	ave you taken an <u>art class outside of school</u> (such <u>wo years</u> ? □ Yes □ No □ Not Sure	as after scho	ol or on weeke	ends) in the pas	st
6		bout how often do you make art outside of schoo □ Every day □ A few times a week □ Once a week □ Once a month □ Never/rarely	ol?			

STUDENT QUESTIONNAIRE - POST (UNFORMATTED)

TREATMENT A

1. The statements below are about works of art that you might see in a museum. For each statement, circle one number that best describes how you feel.

	Strongly disagree	Somewhat disagree	Somewhat agree	Strongly agree
a. I feel amazed when I look at works of art.	1	2	3	4
b. Works of art should not be confusing.	1	2	3	4
c. Things I have learned in school can help me understand works of art.	1	2	3	4
 d. Works of art have clues to help me understand what they mean. 	1	2	3	4
e. Works of art can help me understand what life was like in another time or place.	1	2	3	4
 Works of art are not related to my school work. 	1	2	3	4
g. I can learn about my classmates by listening to them talk about a work of art.	1	2	3	4
h. All people should understand a work of art in the same way.	1	2	3	4
 Works of art help me imagine what life is like for someone else. 	1	2	3	4
j. When I look at works of art, I use what I already know to understand it.	1	2	3	4
 I feel strong emotions when I look at works of art. 	1	2	3	4
I. When I look at works of art, I feel bored.	1	2	3	4
 m. Looking at works of art can give me new ideas. 	1	2	3	4
n. Works of art that are complicated make me curious.	1	2	3	4

0.	Works of art help me see something familiar in a completely new way.	1	2	3	4
p.	To understand what a work of art is about, it is best to have someone tell me.	1	2	3	4
q.	Looking at works of art can help me be a better student.	1	2	3	4
r.	Works of art can help me understand myself better.	1	2	3	4
s.	I can lose track of time when looking at works of art.	1	2	3	4
t.	Talking about works of art can help me understand things I learn in school.	1	2	3	4
h C C	 Please check the one choice that best describes how you feel about art museums. Please be honest in your choice. Good Bored Fascinated Uncomfortable 				
	3. Have you ever visited an art museum with your school? Yes No No Not Sure				
	4. Have you ever visited an art museum outside of school? ☐ Yes ☐ No ☐ Not Sure				
<u>t</u>	5. Have you taken an art class outside of school (such as after school or on weekends) in the past two years? Yes No Not Sure				
6. About how often do you make art outside of school? □ Every day □ A few times a week □ Once a week □ Once a month □ Never/rarely					

TREATMENT B & CONTROL

1. The statements below are about works of art that you might see in a museum. For each statement, circle one number that best describes how you feel.

		Strongly disagree	Somewhat disagree	Somewhat agree	Strongly agree
a.	I feel amazed when I look at works of art.	1	2	3	4
b.	Works of art should not be confusing.	1	2	3	4
c.	Things I have learned in school can help me understand works of art.	1	2	3	4
d.	Works of art have clues to help me understand what they mean.	1	2	3	4
e.	Works of art can help me understand what life was like in another time or place.	1	2	3	4
f.	Works of art are not related to my school work.	1	2	3	4
g.	I can learn about my classmates by listening to them talk about a work of art.	1	2	3	4
h.	All people should understand a work of art in the same way.	1	2	3	4
i.	Works of art help me imagine what life is like for someone else.	1	2	3	4
j.	When I look at works of art, I use what I already know to understand it.	1	2	3	4
k.	I feel strong emotions when I look at works of art.	1	2	3	4
I.	When I look at works of art, I feel bored.	1	2	3	4
m.	Looking at works of art can give me new ideas.	1	2	3	4
n.	Works of art that are complicated make me curious.	1	2	3	4
о.	Works of art help me see something familiar in a completely new way.	1	2	3	4

р.	is best to have someone tell me.	1	2	3	4
q.	Looking at works of art can help me be a better student.	1	2	3	4
r.	Works of art can help me understand myself better.	1	2	3	4
s.	I can lose track of time when looking at works of art.	1	2	3	4
t.	Talking about works of art can help me understand things I learn in school.	1	2	3	4
l () ()	 Please check the one choice that best describes how you feel about art museums. Please be honest in your choice. Good Bored Fascinated Uncomfortable 				
3. H	Have you ever visited an art museum with <u>your so</u> ☐ Yes ☐ No ☐ Not Sure	hool?			
4. H	Have you ever visited an art museum <u>outside of so</u> Yes No Not Sure	chool?			
	Have you taken an <u>art class outside of school</u> (such wo years? Yes No Not Sure	h as after sch	ool or on week	ends) in the pa	nst
6. <i>I</i>	About how often do you make art outside of scho Every day A few times a week Once a week Once a month Never/rarely	ol?			

ASSENT FORM

Assent for Child Participation in Research Study – Questionnaire For Participants 8-12 years





Project Title: NAEA/AAMD Impact of Art Museum

Programs on Students Research Study Principal Investigator: Emily Holtrop, Museum Education

Division Director

Organization: National Art Education Association

The questions on the next few pages are part of a research study. The study we would like you to take part in is for the National Art Education Association (NAEA) and Association of Art Museum Directors (AAMD). It will help art museums across the country improve the programs for other students like you.

What will happen to you if you are in the study?

If you agree to be in this study, the researcher will read aloud the questions on the next few pages about art, and you will select the choice that describes your opinion. There are no right or wrong answers, and you will not be tested about things you learn.

How many people will be in the study?

We are asking 3600 students to complete this questionnaire.

How long will you be in the study?

It will take about 5 minutes to complete. The researcher can stop the questionnaire at any time if they feel it is best for you or the study.

What bad things might happen to you if you are in the study?

No bad things will happen to you. You may feel uncomfortable answering questions about art. Your teacher will not see your responses. Your participation will not affect your grades. Your name will not be used by the researcher, so no one at your school will know what you said. When the study is finished, your responses will be destroyed.

What good things might happen if you are in the study?

There is no direct benefit to you. Your feedback will help art museums across the country improve programming in the future for students like you.

Will you get something if you are in the study?

You will not be paid money to take part.

Do you have to be in this study?

No, you don't. No one will be mad at you if you don't want to do this. It is completely your choice. You can also say yes now and change your mind later. It's up to you. You can stop participating at any time or choose to skip any questions that you don't want to answer. Your parent or guardian has already given permission for you to be in this study. You will be given a copy of this form to keep.

•	rant to be in this study, check the "yes" box below. If you don ne "no" box.	't want to be in this study,
	☐ Yes, I agree to participate in this study.	
	☐ No, I do not agree to participate in this study.	
	Participant Name (please print)	Date
SIGNAT	URES	
	xplained the study to (print name and the child has decided to agree to participate in this study. I $8-12$.	, ,
	Signature of Person Conducting Assent Discussion	Date
	Printed Name of Person Conducting Assent Discussion	

PARENT PERMISSION FORM

The following form is one example. Each permission form was customized to meet the local school district requirements.

Parent/Guardian Permission for Child Participation in Research Study - Columbus





Project Title: NAEA/AAMD Impact of Art Museum

Programs on Students Research Study Principal Investigator: Emily Holtrop, Museum Education

Division Director

Organization: National Art Education Association

Your child is being asked to take part in two questionnaires and interview as part of a larger research study being conducted by Randi Korn & Associates, Inc. for the National Art Education Association (NAEA) and Association of Art Museum Directors (AAMD) with a local partner museum: the Columbus Museum of Art. Participation is voluntary. Please read this permission form and ask any questions that you may have before agreeing that your child participate.

About the Study

Exactly what do students gain from a single-visit programs to art museums? Is the benefit so great that we should invest more into these programs? Or should we rethink how art museums structure their student programs? These are some of the questions our study seeks to answer. The study has been funded by the Institute for Museum & Library Services and includes six museums across the country. As part of the study, we are observing museum programs, interviewing museum educators, as well as surveying and interviewing teachers and students who attend museum programs.

Procedures Affecting Your Child

If you agree for your child to participate in this study, your child will be asked to complete two questionnaires, and participate in one audio-recorded interview:

- 1. Questionnaire A researcher will come to your child's school and administer the questionnaire to students with parent permission during normal school hours. The researcher will explain the study to the students and ask students whether they agree or decline to participate; students who agree will be read the questionnaire aloud and asked to select a response. All questions are about their opinions about art. Your child will be 1 of 3600 children at up to 60 schools to complete questionnaires.
- Interview A researcher will meet with your child one-on-one at his/her school during normal school hours at a time and place designated appropriate by the school. The researcher will explain the study to the student and ask him/her to agree or decline to participate; if your child agrees, he/she will be asked a few questions about an image of a work of art. Your child will be 1 of 720 children at up to 60 schools to complete interviews. If you do not want your child to be audio-recorded, your child cannot take part.

Length of Participation

The questionnaire will be administered twice and will take 5 minutes for your child to complete. Your child will participate in one interview that will take about 10 minutes to complete. The person administering the questionnaire and interview can stop the interview if they feel it is best for your child or for the study. At the end of the interview your child's participation in this study will end.

Risks and Discomforts

There are minimal risks involved in study participation. Your child may feel uncomfortable during the interview when asked to talk about the work of art. The researchers will take care to be sensitive to those feelings. Many steps are being taken to keep your child's information as private as possible, but we can't promise. Your child's name will not be used in any reports or presentations about the study.

Study Benefits

There are no direct benefits to you or your child. Your child's participation will provide valuable insight to the effects of art museum programs. The study is of interest to art museums nationwide.

Confidentiality

Information will be kept as confidential as possible within the limits of the law. Research records will be stored securely and only approved researchers will have access to the records. Your child's information and study data will be kept in this manner until the study is completed and will then be destroyed. A report and presentations of the findings will not include information that will make it possible to identify your child. There are organizations that may inspect and/or copy your child's research records for quality assurance and analysis. These organizations include the sponsoring company or its representatives, relevant governmental agencies, and the Institutional Review Board (IRB) that approved this study. Although it is not likely, it is possible that there may be a risk of loss of privacy or confidentiality.

Cost and Compensation

There are no costs to you associated with your child's participation in this study. There is no compensation.

Voluntary Nature of Participation

Participation in this study is voluntary, meaning that the alternative to participation is to decline. If your child withdraws

or declines participation, it will not affect his/her grades and he/she will not be penalized or lose benefits or services to which your child is otherwise entitled. If your child decides to participate, he/she may decline to answer any questions.

Audio Recording of the Interview

To assist with accurate recording of your child's responses, the interview will be recorded on an audio-recording device. Your child's name will not be associated with this recording, and the

recording will be destroyed after completion of the study. If you do not want your child to be audiorecorded, your child cannot take part in this study and you should not give permission.

If you have concerns or complaints about the research, or if you think your child may have been harmed as a result of taking part in this study, you can contact:

Emily Holtrop, Principal Investigator

Museum Education Division Director, National Art Education Association

Phone: 513-639-2879 / Email: eholtrop@arteducators.org

If you have any questions about your rights as a research participant, concerns or complaints about the research and wish to talk to someone other than individuals on the research team or to offer input, you may contact Ethical and Independent Review Services (the IRB who reviewed this research for subject's rights) at 1-800-472-3241 or subject@eandireview.com.

Parents/guardians please be aware that under the Protection of Pupil Rights Act. 20 U.S.C. Section 1232 (c) (1) (A), you have the right to review a copy of the questions asked of or materials that will be used with your child. If you would like to do so, contact Emily Holtrop (contact information above).

You will be given a copy of this permission form for your records. If you are not given a copy, please request one from Emily Holtrop.

Statement of Consent

I have read the above information. I have asked questions and received satisfactory answers. My child's participation in the study involves participating in two questionnaires and one audio-recorded interview about art.

Please check one box below indicating whether you agree to let your child participate in this study. You and your child are not giving up any legal rights by signing this form.

☐ Yes, I agree to have my child participate in this study and to be audio recorded.				
☐ No, I do not agree to have my child participate in this study.				
Parent's Signature	Date			
Parent's Printed Name				
Child's Name (please print)				

STUDENT INTERVIEWS

[Read assent form]

[Press record, announce ID# and teacher's name]

- 1. When you think of art, what comes to mind?
- What are your feelings about art? How, if at all, do you express your interest in art?
- Now I'm going to show you a reproduction [copy] of a painting from an art museum. Take a moment to look at it and tell me when you are done looking. [show picture]
- 4. What do you see? Anything else?
- 5. What do you think is going on in this painting? What makes you say that?
- What else might be going on? What makes you say that?
- 7. What feelings come to your mind when you look at it? What makes you say that?
- Imagine you are [point to blue man]. What do you think that figure is feeling? Why do you say that?
- What could you guess the artist was thinking about or feeling when painting this?
- 10. Some kids have said this painting is confusing. What do you think of that?
- 11. What do you wonder about as you look at this painting?

Treatment Group C [end interview]. Treatment Groups A and B [continue below].

[Treatment Group A]

- 12. You recently went to the X Museum with your class. Can you close your eyes for a moment and remember back to that visit. What part of your visit stands out as the most memorable? Why do you think you remember that the most?
- 13. At the museum you saw several works of art. I'd like you to think back and recall one for me. Tell me when you are ready. Can you describe that work of art to me? Why did you choose to tell me about that work of art?
- 14. Can you tell me in what way your visit to the museum related to what you are learning in school?

[Treatment Group B]

- 12. A teacher from X Museum recently visited your class. Can you close your eyes for a moment and remember back to that visit. What part of the visit stands out as the most memorable? Why do you think you remember that the most?
- 13. The teacher from X Museum showed you several works of art. I'd like you to think back and recall one for me. Tell me when you are ready. Can you describe that work of art to me? Why did you choose to tell me about that work of art?
- 14. Can you tell me in what way your classroom visit from the teacher at X Museum related to what you are learning in school?

ASSENT FORM

Assent for Child Participation in Research Study – Interview For Participants 8-12 years





Project Title: NAEA/AAMD Impact of Art Museum Programs on Students Research Study

Principal Investigator:

Emily Holtrop, Museum Education

Division Director

Organization: National Art Education Association

Why are we meeting with you?

We want to tell you about something we are doing called a research study. The study we would like you to take part in is for the National Art Education Association (NAEA) and Association of Art Museum Directors (AAMD). It is about art.

Why are we doing this study?

This study is being done to explore the effect of art museum programs on students, so art museums across the country can improve the programs for other students like you.

What will happen to you if you are in the study?

If you agree to be in this study, you will participate in one one-on-one audio-recorded interview with a researcher. The researcher will ask you to look at a work of art and share what you see and think about it. There are no right or wrong answers, and you will not be tested about things you learn. If you do not want to be audio-recorded, you cannot take part. The interview will take place at your school during school hours.

How many people will be in the study?

There will be 720 students who participate in interviews. These students will be randomly selected from among those students who agree to participate in the study. Random selection means that we are not using any specific reasons to choose who will be interviewed.

How long will you be in the study?

The interview will take about 10 minutes. The researcher doing the interview can stop the interview at any time if they feel it is best for you or the study. At the end of the interview your participation in this study will end.

What bad things might happen to you if you are in the study?

No bad things will happen to you. You may feel uncomfortable answering questions about art. The person you talk to will be a researcher. The researcher will audio-record the interview to capture exactly what you say, but your name will not be used so no one at your school will know what you said. If you choose to take part or not to take part or if you agree and then change your mind, it will not affect your grades. When the study is finished, your answers and the audio recording will be destroyed.

What good things might happen to you if you are in the study?

There is no direct benefit to you. Your feedback will help art museums across the country improve programming in the future for students like you.

Will you get something if you are in the study?

You will not be paid money to take part.

Do you have to be in this study?

No, you don't. No one will be mad at you if you don't want to do this. It is completely your choice. You can also say yes now and change your mind later. It's up to you. You can stop participating at any time or choose to skip any questions that you don't want to answer. Just tell the researcher you want to stop and the interview will end. You will not be punished or lose any benefits you already have if you choose not to take part or stop taking part. Your parent or guardian has already given permission for you to be in this study.

Do you have any questions?

You can ask questions any time. You can ask me now. You can ask someone else later. You can also ask to speak with your parent or guardian before you decide.

If you have questions, concerns, complaints, or would like to give us feedback you can call or email the head researcher Emily Holtrop at 513-639-2879 or eholtrop@arteducators.org, or you can call the group at E&I Review, who are not doing this study but evaluated this study, at 1-800-472-3241.

Do you want to participate?

If you want to be in this study, check the "yes" box below and write your name. If you don't want to be in this study, check the "no" box below. Your parent or guardian has already given permission for you to be in this study. You will be given a copy of this form to keep.

Yes, I agree to participate in theNo, I do not agree to be in this		
Participant Name (please print)		
GNATURES have explained the study to bove, and the child has decided to agree confirm they are between the ages of 8 – 2	to participate in this study and b	child) using the language be audio recorded. I
Signature of Person Conducting A	assent Discussion	Date
Printed Name of Person Conducti	ing Assaul Discussion	

PARENT PERMISSION FORM

The following form is one example. Each permission form was customized to meet the local school district requirements.

Parent/Guardian Permission for Child Participation in Research Study - Orange County Interview





Project Title: NAEA/AAMD Impact of Art Museum

Programs on Students Research Study Principal Investigator: Emily Holtrop, Museum Education

Division Director

Organization: National Art Education Association

Your child is being asked to take part in an interview as part of a larger research study being conducted by Randi Korn & Associates, Inc. for the National Art Education Association (NAEA) and Association of Art Museum Directors (AAMD) with a local partner museum: the Orlando Museum of Art. Participation is voluntary. Please read this permission form and ask any questions that you may have before agreeing that your child participate.

Purpose of the Study

To explore the impact of art museum programs on children.

Procedures

If you agree for your child to participate in this study, your child will be asked to participate in one audio-recorded interview. A researcher will meet with your child one-on-one at his/her school during normal school hours. If your child agrees, he/she will be asked a few questions about an image of a work of art. Your child will be 1 of 720 children at six schools to complete interviews. If you do not want your child to be audio-recorded, your child cannot take part.

Length of Participation

Your child will participate in one interview that will take about 10 minutes to complete. The person doing the interview can stop the interview at any time if they feel it is best for your child or for the study. At the end of the interview your child's participation in this study will end.

Risks and Discomforts

There are minimal risks involved in study participation. Your child may feel uncomfortable during the interview when asked to talk about the work of art. The researchers will take care to be sensitive to those feelings. Many steps are being taken to keep your child's information as private as possible, but we can't promise. Your child's name will not be used in any reports or presentations about the study.

Study Benefits

There are no direct benefits to you or your child. Your child's participation will provide valuable insight to the effects of art museum programs. The study is of interest to art museums nationwide.

Confidentiality

Information will be kept as confidential as possible within the limits of the law. Research records will be stored securely and only approved researchers will have access to the records. Your child's information and study data will be kept in this manner until the study is completed and will then be destroyed. A report and presentations of the findings will not include information that will make it possible to identify your child. There are organizations that may inspect and/or copy your child's research records for quality assurance and analysis. These organizations include the sponsoring company or its representatives, relevant governmental agencies, and the Institutional Review Board (IRB) that approved this study. Although it is not likely, it is possible that there may be a risk of loss of privacy or confidentiality.

Cost and Compensation

There are no costs to you associated with your child's participation in this study. There is no compensation.

Voluntary Nature of Participation

Participation in this study is voluntary, meaning that the alternative to participation is to decline. If your child withdraws

or declines participation, it will not affect his/her grades and he/she will not be penalized or lose benefits or services to which your child is otherwise entitled. If your child decides to participate, he/she may decline to answer any questions.

Audio Recording of the Interview

To assist with accurate recording of your child's responses, the interview will be recorded on an audio-recording device. Your child's name will not be associated with this recording, and the recording will be destroyed after completion of the study. If you do not want your child to be audiorecorded, your child cannot take part in this study and you should not give permission.

If you have concerns or complaints about the research, or if you think your child may have been harmed as a result of taking part in this study, you can contact:

Emily Holtrop, Principal Investigator

Museum Education Division Director, National Art Education Association

Phone: 513-639-2879 / Email: eholtrop@arteducators.org

If you have any questions about your rights as a research participant, concerns or complaints about the research and wish to talk to someone other than individuals on the research team or to offer input, you may contact Ethical and Independent Review Services (the IRB who reviewed this research for subject's rights) at 1-800-472-3241 or subject@eandireview.com.

Parents/guardians please be aware that under the Protection of Pupil Rights Act. 20 U.S.C. Section 1232 (c) (1) (A), you have the right to review a copy of the questions asked of or materials that will be used with your child. If you would like to do so, contact Emily Holtrop (contact information above).

You will be given a copy of this permission form for your records. If you are not given a copy, please request one from Emily Holtrop.

Statement of Consent

I have read the above information. I have asked questions and received satisfactory answers. My child's participation in the study involves participating in one audio-recorded interview about art.

Please check one box below indicating whether you agree to let your child participate in this study. You and your child are not giving up any legal rights by signing this form.

☐ Yes, I agree to have my child participate in this study and to be audio recorded.				
☐ No, I do not agree to have my child participate in this study.				
Parent's Signature	Date			
Parent's Printed Name				
Child's Name (please print)				

ANALYTICAL TOOL

BACKGROUND CONTEXT	
CATEGORICAL VARIABLES	
A. IMPRESSION OF ART	SELECT ALL THAT APPLY.
	YOU <u>DO NOT</u> NEED TO CHECK ONE BOX PER CATEGORY.
Responses will come from the following	The student's response suggests
question <u>only</u> :	Who makes art
 Q1: "When you think of art, what 	Art is something other people ("artists") make
comes to mind?"	Art is something <u>anyone</u> can make
	Art is something <u>I make</u>
	What art looks like
	Art is beautiful
	Art does not need to be beautiful
	How art is made
	Art involves creativity, imagination
	Art involves craftsmanship, skill
	Art materials and mediums
	How art makes you feel
	Art evokes an emotion
	Other opinions
	I like art (general)
	I don't know/no impression of art
	Other, please describe:
B. INTEREST IN ART	SELECT ONE. The student's feelings about art are
	Positive
Response will likely come from the	Neutral
following question but items should be	Negative
selected if evidenced across the whole	Unclear
interview:	
 Q2a: "What are your feelings about art?" 	
C. PARTICIPATION IN ART	SELECT ALL THAT APPLY. The student says they
	Make their own art
Responses will likely come from the	Copy/duplicate works of art seen
following question but items should be	Look at/think about/discuss works of art created by others in general
selected if evidenced across the whole	Look at/think about/discuss works of art created by others in a
interview:	<u>museum</u>
Q2b: "How, if at all, do you	Are not good at making art
express your interest in art?"	Do not name an example of visual art participation
	Other, please describe:

RUBRIC SCORES	RUBRIC SCORES				
Rubric Indicators	1 - Below Beginning	2 - Beginning	3 - Developing	4 - Accomplished	
D. OBSERVES & DESCRIBES Chagall artwork Responses will come from the following question only: Q4: "What do you see?"	The student's description of the work of art is cursory and incomplete. The student describes/identifies few parts of the work of art but not in detail (e.g., the scorer cannot envision the work in their head beyond a few elements).	The student's description of the work of art is somewhat cursory and incomplete. The student describes/identifies a few parts of the work of art in some detail but the observation is limited to obvious parts of the image (e.g., the chicken, man at top, tree, donkey).	The student's description of the work of art is somewhat detailed and complete. The student describes/identifies many parts of the work of art (including beyond the most obvious) and often in detail, but the description does not describe the relationship/placement/prominence of parts of the work of art.	The student's description of the work of art is detailed <u>and</u> mostly complete. The student describes/identifies many parts of the work of art in detail <u>AND</u> describes the relationship/placement/prominence among some parts of the work of art (e.g., the scorer has a mostly clear image of the work in their head).	
	I saw two chickens, two people, and a tree. [Anything else?] No.	I see a hen. And a man. And a duck. I see a donkey playing the violin, and I see another man holding his jacket. And I see a red man and a tree. [Anything else?] I see the sky, a hill. I see the moon. That's it.	Okay, I see a turkey or a chicken, one of 'em. I see a person by the chicken's feet. I see a person in the sky wearing a hat. I see another chicken. I see a person. I see a donkey with a guitar. I see a person behind the tree and I see a tree, and a see a moon, half a moon. And I see the sky really mostly.	I see a little rooster and a guy who looks like he fell off the rooster and he looks like he's trying to get that little chicken or big rooster. And then there's a cow playing the banjo or I don't know that is, the violin. And then there's this guy who looks like he's trying to kill that guy and then there's this man who's in redyeah, it's the green guy and he's trying to kill the little animal right there. [Is there anything else?] There's a tree that he's hiding behind and it's nighttime 'cause there's a moon. That's it.	

CRITICAL THINKING				
RUBRIC SCORES				
Rubric Indicators	1 - Below Beginning	2 - Beginning	3 - Developing	4 - Accomplished
artwork Responses will likely come from the following question but should be scored based on entire discussion of Chagall work of art (i.e., do not consider evidence from treatment-only questions): • Q5: "What do you think is going on in this painting?" I don't really know what's going on, but I just keep noticing it's him playing the guitar. OR What I think about what's going on in the painting is somebody who got creating and just kind of random the in it. [What makes you say that?] Because what I thin this is because there's a puthat's playing an instrume and with an animal head	evidence to explain their claim about what is going on in the work of art. Student may closely repeat interpretation	The student provides partially relevant evidence to explain their claim about what is going on in the work of art, but the explanation is vague and/or cursory (lacking detail) and not clearly aligned with the interpretation.	The student provides mostly relevant evidence to explain their claim about what is going on in the work of art. The response is somewhat vague and/or cursory (lacking detail) though aligned with interpretation.	The student provides mostly relevant evidence to explain their claim about what is going on in the work of art. The response is specific and clearly aligned with the interpretation (may be brief but conveys the idea well).
	noticing it's him playing the guitar. OR What I think about what's going on in the painting is somebody who got creative and just kind of random things in it. [What makes you say that?] Because what I think of this is because there's a person that's playing an instrument	There's a huge chicken running towards a tree and there's a man floating above the chicken, guiding the chicken. [What makes you say that?] Because the man is holding his hand out towards the tree, so it looks like he's guiding the chicken.	I think the red chicken is just wandering around and the guy up above is trying to reach over something or trying to get something, like the little chicken in the corner near the moon. And I see a sheep just walking around, feeling like relaxing and playing his violin. Then I see a guy behind them, watching and hearing while the sheep plays the violin. [What makes you say that?] The guy back behind the tree looks like he just came out of the forest and wanted to relax. The red chicken just looks like it's following and what makes me say that is the way the art looks.	They're putting a lullaby. The person under the tree is doing a lullaby 'cause I see the moon and the chicken and the people are probably just going home and listen to the lullaby while they go home. [What makes you say that?] Because the people, they're — 'cause the man that's in the sky, he looks like he's going home after a hard day of work and because they probably work. And he probably works the night shift and he listens to the person under the tree and the chicken who looks like he just came from a farm and just going to his cage.
CATEGORICAL VARIABLES				
F. USES ART ELEMENTS/PRINC Chagall artwork <u>in Q4 or Q5</u>	•	ect if used at least once in descr ine/shape/form color/value	ibing the Chagall artwork: space/scale texture makes gesture	es art materials/medium none
G. CONNECTS OBSERVATIONS KNOWLEDGE/UNDERSTANDIN Chagall artwork	G/ EXPERIENCE with	Select one based on observation of the Chagall artwork: Yes, the student connects observations to previous k/u/e at least once. No, the student does not connect any observations to previous k/u/e. Uncertain, the student says something that suggests a connection, but we cannot be certain.		

CRITICAL THINKING (TREATM	CRITICAL THINKING (TREATMENT ONLY)					
RUBRIC SCORES	RUBRIC SCORES					
Rubric Indicators	1 - Below Beginning	2 - Beginning	3 - Developing	4 - Accomplished		
H. OBSERVES & DESCRIBES an artwork from the museum program Only consider evidence from treatment-only questions: • Q12: What part of the visit stands out as the most The student's description of the work of art is cursory and incomplete. The student describes/ identifies few parts of the work of art but not in detail (e.g., the scorer cannot envision the work in their head beyond a few elements).	The student's description of the work of art is somewhat cursory and incomplete. The student describes/identifies a few parts of the work of art in some detail but the observation is limited to obvious parts of the image (from what the scorer can tell).	The student's description of the work of art is somewhat detailed and complete. The student describes/identifies many parts of the work of art and often in detail, but the description does not describe the relationship/ placement/prominence of parts of the work of art.	The student's description of the work of art is detailed and mostly complete. The student describes/identifies many parts of the work of art in detail AND describes the relationship/ placement/prominence among some parts of the work of art (e.g., the scorer has a mostly clear image of the work in their head).			
memorable? Why? Q13: I'd like you to think back and recall one work of art. Can you describe that work of art? Why did you choose to tell me about that work of art?	The work of art was – it was very interesting. When you'd look at it and it's just a work of art that you never think that you would see before and it's very cool.	It was by – what's his name? I forgot his name, but he used to draw people. It was women that one side of their face looked normal and then the other side looked like something else.	I remember one picture of a little girl. She was a little girl and she was probably babysitting her little brother and they was on a farm. And then if you walk to the left, she looked to the left, but the picture wasn't really moving. If you went to the right, she'll move – she'll look to the right and it looked realistic.	I think it was the shade of grey with the black gate on it — with the gate on it and the sky with the moon in it. It was black ground on it. [Can you describe that work for me?] The ground was black and it had a silver gate on it, and it was a moon in the sky, but the sky was kind of bluish and white. And it was no birds flying around. It was just bluish and had marks in the sky.		
CATEGORICAL VARIABLES						
_	I. USES ART ELEMENTS/PRINCIPLES in description of artwork from museum program Select if used at least once in describing an artwork seen in museum/classroom: line/shape/form color/value space/scale texture makes gestures art materials/medium none					
J. CONNECTS OBSERVATIONS KNOWLEDGE/UNDERSTAND artwork from museum progr	ING/ EXPERIENCE with	Select one based on observation of an artwork seen in museum/classroom: Yes, the student connects observations to previous k/u/e at least once. No, the student does not connect any observations to previous k/u/e. Uncertain, the student says something that suggests a connection, but we cannot be certain.				

CREATIVE THINKING	CREATIVE THINKING					
RUBRIC SCORES						
Indicators	1 - Below Beginning	2 - Beginning	3 - Developing	4 - Accomplished		
K. IMAGINES/ ENVISIONS POSSIBILITIES with Chagall artwork Responses will likely come from the following	The student does not provide a second interpretation (i.e., when asked Q6, may repeat first interpretation exactly).	The student provides a second interpretation, but it is very similar to the first interpretation.	The student provides a second interpretation that is divergent from the first, but the interpretation is limited or cursory.	The student provides a second interpretation that is divergent from the first, and the interpretation is thorough and robust.		
question but should be scored based on entire discussion of Chagall work of art (i.e., do not consider evidence from treatment-only questions): • Q5: "What do you think is going on in this painting?" • Q6: "What else might be going on?"	First interpretation: I don't really know. It's actually pretty confusing, but if I had a long, long time to look at it, I feel like I would get it more. Second interpretation: I don't really know because there's also this in the background, which I don't really know what would be part of. It's all kind of all different. I don't get how it all would go together.	First interpretation: A celebration. [What makes you say that?] Cause they're all wearing these nice clothes and they're all running around and playing music. Second interpretation: They're celebrating maybe the chicken got out and they're all trying to catch them.	First interpretation: I think this chicken is running towards the tree and I think this one right here is listening to the goat, and this one is trying to jump over the tree. And then I think the sun and moon is trying to make a eclipse. Second interpretation: I can kinda see that this tree right here is leaning as if the person right here was pushing it down. Because how the angle of the tree.	First interpretation: I think the man that's floating in the sky is supposed to be the man on the moon, and then the chicken and the donkey with the violin are playing hide and seek. [What makes you say that?] Because it looks like the donkey is hiding and then the chicken is looking around, and then the moon man is just looking all around in a white suit with dots. Second interpretation: The other thing is that the chicken and the moon man might be dancing and the donkey maybe playing music under the tree. [What makes you say that?] The donkey has a violin, which plays music, and the chicken is just lifting one leg up like it's dancing and the moon man is just having his hand up.		

CREATIVE THINKING RUBRIC SCORES 1 - Below Beginning 2 - Beginning 3 - Developing 4 - Accomplished **Indicators** L. DEMONSTRATES The student demonstrates The student demonstrates The student does not indicate any The student demonstrates little **COMFORT WITH** high discomfort with the some discomfort with the discomfort with the ambiguity of the discomfort with the ambiguity **AMBIGUITY with Chagall** ambiguity of the artwork ambiguity of the artwork artwork (e.g., students talk comfortably of the artwork. (e.g., students artwork (e.g., responses about the (e.g., students may frame about the artwork and might say "art is talk comfortably about the Responses may come artwork are limited or most of their responses supposed to make you think," etc.). artwork overall but may say from across the vague, may include several about the artwork as occasionally that it is discussion of the Chagall "I don't know's"). "confusing," or "I am not "confusing" or they "aren't artwork. Listening to really sure but...") and/or sure"). audio is important. repeats previous answers. Answers several questions Answers several questions I think they're kind of right and It's kinda confusing to me 'cause I don't "I'm not sure" and responds "I'm not sure" but is able to because if you take your know why they have the chicken...It kinda to q10: Yeah, very confusing come up with responses time and you look at it, you'll makes me curious why they made this 'cause flying guy, weird eventually (particularly after you're never right, but you're painting...sometimes when I create art, I thing over here, looks like a data collectors assure there never wrong. But I think it is kinda confuse myself, too. What I'm thinking and why I'm doing this and then sometimes I man with a donkey head, are no right or wrong confusing because there's a lot and that weird guy in the answers) of things going on. There's the have an explanation, but then sometimes I corner. It's confusing for me. chicken and then there's the guy just draw what I'm thinking about. flying. I think that's – I agree with them.

CREATIVE THINKING RUBRIC SCORES 1 - Below Beginning 2 - Beginning 3 - Developing 4 - Accomplished Indicators M. QUESTIONS & The student does not ask The student asks limited The student asks several The student asks several questions/ wonders **WONDERS** about questions or wonder about questions/wonders questions/wonders moderately moderately about the artwork or artists. **Chagall artwork** the artwork or artist. minimally about the artwork about the artwork or artists. Questions explore "why," and it connects to Responses will likely or artist. Questions are Questions explore "why," but an interpretation/ hypothesis they have come from the following mostly limited to a who, they do not connect the about the artwork/artist. question but should be what, where, or when question to an interpretation/ scored based on entire question and does not touch hypothesis. discussion of Chagall on why. work of art (i.e., do not I wonder what they're gonna Why is the animal and a person I wonder what all the characters are thinking consider evidence from be doing after or what figure – why is the man's hands in their head and what they actually are treatment-only they're really doing. so large? Why is there a man doing. Is this guy doing a happy song or a questions): behind a tree and why is there a sad song? Is this guy trying to surprise him or • Q11: "What do you faint red figure on the bottom something? And is this guy actually flying or wonder about as left? is he just jumping really high? And is this guy you look at this a ghost, invisible, or just outlined? painting?"

HUMAN CONNECTIONS

RUBRIC SCORES

RUBRIC SCORES				
Indicators	1 - Below Beginning	2 - Beginning	3 - Developing	4 - Accomplished
N. CONNECTS WITH LIVED EXPERIENCE through Chagall artwork Responses will likely come from the following question but should be scored based	The student does not identify feelings/emotions.	The student names a feeling/emotion but does not provide visual evidence to support it.	The student names a feeling/emotion and provides visual evidence to support it, but the response is vague and/or cursory.	The student names a feeling/emotion and provide visual evidence to support it, and the response is thorough and/or robust.
on entire discussion of Chagall work of art (i.e., do not consider evidence from treatment-only questions): Q7: "What feelings come to your mind when you look at it? What makes you say that?" Q8: "Imagine you are [point to blue man]. What do you think that figure is feeling? Why do you say that?"	Happiness maybe. [Why do you think that?] Pure guess.	I think he's feeling happy or amazed that he's flying in the sky. [Why do you say that?] Because this person is just not nervous. He's just happy in the sky.	That figure looks happy, so I would feel happy. [Why do you say that?] He's smiling and his eyes look big, in a happy way.	I think he's either feeling really sad that he lost something or that he's still running to get that thing. Maybe he's reaching out and he's like, no, I lost it or maybe he's still flying towards it. I think that he's either sad or nervous. [What makes you say that?] The way he's sort of reaching out with his hands. Seems like he's either trying to grab something as quick as possible or he's reaching out to — either way, he doesn't really know — he knows that he can't get it, but he's trying to anyway. And also the expression on his face and the way his legs are curled up. And it kind of seems like he could be — because he's sad, he's doing that or because he's getting ready to move forward.

HUMAN CONNECTIONS

RUBRIC SCORES

RUDRIC SCURES				
Indicators	1 - Below Beginning	2 - Beginning	3 - Developing	4 - Accomplished
O. INTERPRETS ARTIST'S FEELINGS/THOUGHTS through Chagall artwork Responses will likely come from the following question but should be scored based	The student does not identify what the artist may be feeling/ thinking, or provides a very short, vague response.	The student names a feeling/thought but does not provide visual evidence to support it.	The student names a feeling/thought and provides visual evidence to support it, but the response is vague and cursory.	The student names a feeling/thought and provide visual evidence to support it, and the response is thorough and robust.
on entire discussion of Chagall work of art (i.e., do not consider evidence from treatment-only questions): Q9: What could you guess the artist was thinking about or feeling when painting this?	It feels like it's about what he had in mind.	He probably was stressed and a lot of things were going on their mind. So they just wanted to put it on paper, like, oh, something's happening here. OR I think he was feeling happiness and he was just imagining something if – that would happen in real life.	He might've been happy because I see a few smiling faces and then he might've been feeling musical at the time because he did draw that one person with the guitar.	Maybe the artist was thinking about how he lost something, but it's kind of unclear because there's also — maybe it seems like maybe the person was running away from something, but he was also trying to get something. And there's the guy over here. He's kind of just relaxed and there's something watching him. Maybe he wants to relax, but he can't because there's too many things going on at the same time.

HUMAN CONNECTIONS (TREATMENT ONLY)

RUBRIC SCORES	RUBRIC SCORES					
Indicators	1 - Below Beginning	2 - Beginning	3 - Developing	4 - Accomplished		
P. CONNECTS WITH LIVED EXPERIENCE during the museum program Only consider evidence from treatment-only questions: • Q12: What part of the visit stands out as the most memorable? Why?	The student does not indicate a connection to lived experience (e.g., feelings/emotions/ experiences of the artist, figure(s) in a work of art, or the historical/cultural context) in their recollection of the program experience or a work of art.	The student indicates a vague or cursory connection to lived experience (e.g., feelings/emotions/experiences of the artist, figure(s) in a work of art, or the historical/cultural context) in their recollection of the program experience or a work of art.	The student indicates a clear connection to lived experience (e.g., feelings /emotions/experiences of the artist, figure(s) in a work of art, or the historical/cultural context) in their recollection of the program experience or a work of art, but the response lacks visual evidence.	The student indicates a vivid and robust connection to lived experience (e.g., feelings/emotions/experiences of the artist, figure(s) in a work of art, or the historical/cultural context) in their recollection of the program experience or a work of art and provides visual evidence to support it.		
Q13: I'd like you to think back and recall one work of art. Can you describe that work of art? Why did you choose to tell me about that work of art? Art?	[What part of your visit stands out as the most memorable?] The statues. [Why do you think you remember that the most?] Because they were all detailed. [Can you describe the work of art to me?] It was by – what's his name? I forgot his name, but he used to draw people. It was women that one side of their face looked normal and then the other side looked like something else. [Why did you choose to tell me about that work of art?] Because that one actually standed out.	When we really got in there, they – this lady, she showed us a guy. He looked like a rock star and he painted it for himself because he wanted to feel how people wanted to see how he felt and he felt kind of bad and – yeah.	When was in the art with Africa, they had these dolls that they have to figure and design and they have royalty. They have crowns and nose rings and sparkle on their face. [Why did you choose to tell me about that work of art?] Because it was important because back then, they had all this stuff and all this stuff to do and find their food and express their feelings and wear their clothes different ways.	I remember when there was African Americans and white people, who the police were trying to fight back a white person. And an African American woman was trying to tell the police probably to let him go because he's innocent. And I remember that because a lot of slavery was happening back then, which was not very good. I think that person was trying to help stop slavery. [Interviewer: Why did you choose to tell me about that work of art?] Because I feel like a lot of people are still doing slavery right now, which is not good and I feel like people should have because at the end of the day, a lot of people are just humans. It doesn't really matter about our skin color and our race.		

SENSORIAL AND AFFECTIVE RES	PONSES (TREATMENT ONLY)			
Indicators	1 - Below Beginning	2 - Beginning	3 - Developing	4 - Accomplished
Q. RECALL PROGRAM EXPERIENCE (INCLUDING WORK OF ART) VIVIDLY Responses will come from the	The student provides a response that lacks any emotional response to the museum/classroom visit or work of art.	The student provides a response that indicates little emotional response to the museum/classroom visit or work of art.	The student provides a response that indicates some emotional response to the museum/ classroom visit or work of art.	The student provides a response that indicates strong emotional response to the museum/classroom visit or work of art.
questions: • Q12: What part of the visit stands out as the most memorable? Why? • Q13: I'd like you to think back and recall one work of art. Can you describe that work of art? Why did you choose to tell me about that work of art?	The part where we were looking at the Native American and Roger Williams picture. [Why do you think you remember that the most?] Because what we did was kind of different because we were in more of a home kind of placeso it was different from all the other places in the museum.	When I saw the lion 'cause I didn't know exactly what it was and then when I found out, it was very exciting to learn about. [Why do you think you remember that the most?] BecauseI don't exactly know.	The part where we went to the room just full of paintings and stuff. [Why do you think that you remember that the most?] 'Cause the paintings in there were amazing. They were so fascinating. I was really intrigued with them.	The most memorable to me was when we went in the room and there was, I guess, a Buddha and it was a king that gave it all away just because of the people that had nothing. He gave it away to them. To me, that was really something because there's lots of things in the world that are like that, but not everybody's willing to give them out. That's what would be most memorable to me. [Why do you think you remember that the most?] Because there's a lot of things in the world like that, where people don't have certain stuff, but he was willing to give it all away and I think that's really kind hearted and sweet.
CATEGORICAL VARIABLES				tillik that 3 really kind hearted and sweet.
Responses will come from the questions: • Q12: What part of the visit stands out as the most memorable? Why? • Q13: I'd like you to think back and recall one work of art. Can you describe that work of art? Why did you Other		Select all aspects mentioned at least once in describing their program experience: Physical space/atmosphere of museum (treatment A only) Experiencing the museum with peers (e.g. friends, classmates) Experience with docent/museum staff None of the above Other (please specify): Specific work(s) of art. Please specify title (or brief description) of work(s) of art described:		

ACADEMIC CONNECTIONS (TREATMENT ONLY) RUBRIC SCORES 1 - Below Beginning 2 - Beginning 3 - Developing 4 - Accomplished Indicators S. CONNECTS PROGRAM The student does not make a The student makes a The student makes a The student makes a **EXPERIENCE TO LEARNING IN** connection between the generic/vague connection connection between the connection between the SCHOOL museum/ classroom visit and between the museum/ museum/ classroom visit and museum/ classroom visit and their learning in school. classroom visit and their their learning in school, and their learning in school and Responses will come from the learning in school, but provides provides some supplemental provides a robust and thorough questions: little detail or context (e.g., it context about the connection. description of the connection. • **Q14:** Can you tell me in helped me in science and social what way your visit to the studies). museum related to what Maybe there's really nothing in There's a lot of ancient Because we have an art class It kind of related to science you are learning in school? civilization stuff in social common. below us and sometimes she because all of the recycled studies. We're learning about teaches us about art, those kind objects were things that you Mesopotamia and Egypt and of arts. could find outside and in the Hindus and the Greeks and science, we're - our next thing OR all those. It kind of links up is going outside and making together. We saw some of the mixtures and stuff. So yeah, We do learn about immigration art from that time. that relates to that. and – yeah, stuff like that, that I saw at the museum. OR Because we were talking about colors and texture and shapes and size.

STUDENT INTERVIEW FINDINGS: SUPPLEMENTAL INFORMATION

OBSERVATION & DESCRIPTION

Students were asked to observe and describe the Chagall work of art before being asked to interpret it. In doing so, RK&A indicated the types of descriptions students used. Almost onehalf of students did not use any art elements when describing works of art. Of those responses that did use art elements, color and value followed by space and scale were most mentioned. Note that the use of art elements did not differ by study group.

OBSERVATIONS OF CHAGALL

	% of responses by study group			
Art elements	Treatment A museum program (n = 237)	Treatment B classroom program (n = 166)	Control no program (n = 227)	
No art elements used in description	39	44	46	
Color/value	41	30	36	
Space/scale	31	36	33	
Line/shape/form	4	4	4	
Art materials/mediums	3	1	1	
Texture	0	0	0	

SENSORIAL AND AFFECTIVE RESPONSES

Students were asked what stood out as most memorable about their visit. The majority of times, students immediately began speaking about a work of art that was memorable but other responses were counted for context. Most notable, the docent or staff facilitating the program was referenced in the response 15 percent of the time, and more frequently for classroom programs than museum programs (22 percent versus 10 percent) (p = .002).

Facilitator experience

	% of responses by study group		
	Treatment A Treatmen		
	museum program	classroom program	
Art elements	(n = 237)	(n = 166)	
Mention facilitator when describing memorable aspects	10	22	

TEACHER QUESTIONNAIRE

TEACHER QUESTIONNAIRE

Three versions of the questionnaire were designed, with slight variations in wording on each depending on the teachers' study group. All questionnaires are similar to the one below, designed for Treatment A teachers.

rie	ase answer the following questions to the best of your ab	инсу.	
Abo	out You and Your Students		
1.	What grade(s) are you teaching this year? Select all that apply. 4th 5th 6th Other:		After your visit, what did you do with your student in the classroom to reflect back on their museum visit? Select all that apply. Nothing Used activities/lessons provided by the museum Used my own activities/lessons with students
2.	What subject are you teaching this year? Select one. □ Elementary education (multiple subjects) □ Studio art/art history □ History/social studies		☐ Referred back to our museum visit during a classroom lesson ☐ Showed students images of works of art that we saw at the museum ☐ Other:
3.	☐ Other: Select the one choice that best describes your		What do you think the students took away from th museum visit?
	relationship to the class with which you visited the x Museum?		
	My class for all subjects except specials		
	☐ My class that is co-taught ☐ My class for homeroom only		
	☐ My class for a single subject only		
	☐ They are not my class/helping another teacher ☐ Other		
4.	Do the students you accompanied on the museum visit include any of the following? Select all that apply.		
	☐ Gifted		Is there any other feedback you would like to share
	☐ Special Education ☐ English Language Learner		with the museum about your visit?
	☐ Bilingual		
	<u>iseum Visit</u> ese questions are about the visit to the x Museum.		
****	ese questions are about the visit to the x museum		
5.	Before your visit to x Museum, did you do anything to prepare? Select all that apply. Please indicate		
	only those things <u>you</u> did—not another teacher.		
	☐ Nothing ☐ Used activities/lessons provided by the museum to		
	prepare students ☐ Used my own activities/lessons to prepare students ☐ Showed students images of what we might see	Plea	se proceed to the second page.
	☐ Provided the museum information about what we are studying	For	Office Use Only:
	☐ Requested the museum visit include certain works	ID:	
	of art		

Your Student	s' School	Experiences
--------------	-----------	-------------

In the following questions, "students" refers specifically to the group of students you brought to the x Museum.

9. To the best of your knowledge, please indicate how frequently your students experience the following at school this year. Circle one response per row.

Attend an art class taught by a certified art teacher	Daily	Weekly	Infrequently	Never
Make art as part of classroom projects (e.g., dioramas, posters, etc.)	Daily	Weekly	Infrequently	Never
Discuss reproductions of original works of art	Daily	Weekly	Infrequently	Never

10.	This year, which museums or cultural institutions have your students visited? Please identify the institution and briefly
	describe the visit (e.g., took guided tour of the historic site, teacher-led visit to Egyptian exhibition).

a.	Institution:	
c.	Institution:	
	Description:	

11. This year, what museums or cultural institutions have provided programs at your school? Please indicate the institution(s) and include a brief description of the activities that were provided (e.g., school-wide lecture presentation by an art museum, history museum provided an in-classroom hands-on experience).

a.	Institution:	
b.		
c.	Institution:	

12. Please rate the importance you place on each of the following possible art museum experiences for your students on a scale from 1, "not important to me," to 7, "very important to me." Circle one response per row.

	Not important to me				portant to me		
Students see original works of art	1	2	3	4	5	6	7
Students learn from experts about works of art	1	2	3	4	5	6	7
Students apply classroom learning in an art museum	1	2	3	4	5	6	7
Students develop new knowledge/skills during their art museum experience related to school curriculum	1	2	3	4	5	6	7
Students connect with human experience across culture, time, & place during their art museum experience	1	2	3	4	5	6	7
Students think critically at the art museum	1	2	3	4	5	6	7
Students think creatively at the art museum	1	2	3	4	5	6	7
Students have an awe-inspiring experience at the art museum	1	2	3	4	5	6	7

Thank you for completing the survey!

CONSENT FORM (for questionnaire and interview)

Consent for Teacher Participation in Research Study – Questionnaire & Interview





Project Title: NAEA/AAMD Impact of Art Museum

Programs on Students Research Study Principal Investigator: Emily Holtrop, Museum Education

Division Director

National Art Education Association Organization:

You are being asked to volunteer to complete a questionnaire as part of a larger research study being conducted by Randi Korn & Associates, Inc. for the National Art Education Association (NAEA) and Association of Art Museum Directors (AAMD). Participation is voluntary. Please read this consent form and ask any questions that you may have before agreeing to participate.

Purpose of the Study

To explore the impact of art museum programs on children.

Procedures

If you agree to participate in this study, you will complete one standardized questionnaire and may be selected to participate in one audio-recorded telephone interview. The questionnaire and interview ask about your students and your teaching. You will be 1 of up to 216 teachers at 60 schools to complete the questionnaire. If selected, the interview will be scheduled at your convenience. If you are chosen, you will be 1 of 18 teachers at 60 schools to participate in the interview. If you do not want to be audio-recorded, you cannot take part in the interview portion of this study.

Length of Participation

You will complete one questionnaire that will take about 5 minutes to complete. You also may be selected to participate in one interview that will take up to 20 minutes to complete. The researcher doing the interview can stop the interview at any time if they feel it is best for you or the study. At the end of the interview your participation in this study will end.

Risks and Discomforts

There are minimal risks involved in study participation. Many steps are being taken to keep your information as private as possible, but we cannot promise. Your name will not be used in any reports or presentations about the study.

Study Benefits

There are no direct benefits to you. Your participation will provide valuable insight to the effects of art museum programs. The study is of interest to art museums nationwide.

Confidentiality

Information will be kept as confidential as possible within the limits of the law. Research records will be stored securely and only approved researchers will have access to the records. Your information and study data will be kept in this manner until the study is completed and will then be destroyed. A report and presentations of the findings will not include information that will make it possible to identify you. There are organizations that may inspect and/or copy research records for quality assurance and analysis. These organizations include the sponsoring company or its representatives, relevant governmental agencies, and the Institutional Review Board (IRB) that approved this study. Although it is not likely, it is possible that there may be a risk of loss of privacy or confidentiality.

Cost and Compensation

There are no costs to you associated with your participation in this study. There is no compensation.

Voluntary Nature of Participation

Participation in this study is voluntary, meaning that the alternative to participation is to decline. If you withdraw or decline participation, it will not affect your employment and you will not be penalized or lose benefits or services to which you are otherwise entitled. If you decide to participate, you may decline to answer any questions.

Audio Recording of the Interview

If you are chosen to be interviewed, to assist with accurate recording of your responses, the interview will be recorded on an audio-recording device. Your name will not be associated with this recording, and the recording will be destroyed after completion of the study. If you do not want to be audiorecorded, you cannot take part in the interview portion of the study.

Contacts and Questions

If you have concerns or complaints about the research, or if you think you may have been harmed as a result of taking part in this study, you can contact:

Emily Holtrop, Principal Investigator

Museum Education Division Director, National Art Education Association

Phone: 513-639-2879 / Email: eholtrop@arteducators.org

If you have any questions about your rights as a research participant, concerns or complaints about the research and wish to talk to someone other than individuals on the research team or to offer input, you may contact Ethical and Independent Review Services (the IRB who reviewed this research for subject's rights) at 1-800-472-3241 or subject@eandireview.com.

You will be given a copy of this consent form for your records. If you are not given a copy, please request one from Emily Holtrop.

Statement of Consent

I have read the above information. I have asked questions and received satisfactory answers. My participation in the study involves completing one questionnaire. Please check one box below

ting whether you agree to participate in this study. You are not giving up a g this form.	any legal rights by
☐ Yes, I agree to participate in this study and to be audio recorded.	
☐ No, I do not agree to participate in this study.	
Participant Signature	Date
Printed Name	
Email Address (to schedule interview if selected)	

TEACHER QUESTIONNAIRE FINDINGS: SUPPLEMENTAL INFORMATION

TEACHER AND CLASS CHARACTERISTICS

One-half of respondents (49 percent) were Treatment A (museum program) teachers, more than one-third (38 percent) were Treatment B (classroom program) teachers, and several (13 percent) were Control (no program) teachers. Nearly one-half taught fourth grade and nearly one-half taught fifth grade (47 percent each)—several taught sixth grade (10 percent). Many teach general elementary education in multiple subjects (75 percent), and a few each teach studio art/art history (10 percent), math/science (8 percent), history/social studies (3 percent), or some other subject (4 percent).

Study group	% of questionnaires (n = 92)
A (Museum visit)	49
B (Classroom visit)	13
C (Control)	38

Grade(s) taught this year (select all that apply)	% of questionnaires (n = 92)
Fourth grade	47
Fifth grade	47
Sixth grade	10

Cubic attal Associate this constraint	% of questionnaires
Subject(s) taught this year	(n = 92)
Elementary education (multiple subjects)	75
Studio art/art history	10
Other: math/science	8
Other: miscellaneous ⁴	4
History/social studies	3

⁴ Other subjects included: history and English; music; theater; STEAM; English Language Arts and Social Studies.

Treatment A (museum program) teachers and Treatment B (classroom program) teachers were asked about their relationship to the class(es) participating in the study (e.g., "the class with which you visited X Museum with"). One-half of respondents taught the participating classroom for all subjects except specials (53 percent); one-quarter taught the participating classroom for a single subject only (27 percent); and a few each co-taught the participating class (7 percent), taught the participating class for homeroom only (4 percent), or had some other relationship with the participating class (9 percent).

All respondents were asked about special student populations in their classroom. Two-thirds reported that their classroom included special education (67 percent), English Language Learner (ELL) (65 percent), or gifted students. One-half reported having bilingual students (51 percent).

Relationship to class participating in study	% of questionnaires (n = 55) ⁵
My class for all subjects except specials	53
My class for a single subject only	27
Other: miscellaneous ⁶	9
My class is co-taught	7
My class for homeroom only	4

Special student populations in class participating in study (select all that apply)	% of questionnaires (n = 92)
Special Education	67
English Language Learners (ELL)	65
Gifted	60
Bilingual	51

⁵ Question not asked of Control (no program) teachers.

⁶ Other miscellaneous responses include teachers who teach two subjects to the study participant classroom and one blank response.

FREQUENCY OF VISITS TO MUSEUMS

Teachers were asked which museums or cultural institutions their students had visited so far this year. Many said their students did not visit any museum or cultural institution (70 percent), onefifth said they visited one museum or cultural institution (21 percent), and a few visited two or more (9 percent). About one-fifth of museum visits were to an art museum.

VISITS TO MUSEUMS

Frequency of visits to any type of museum so far this year	% of questionnaires (n = 90)
None	70
At least once	30
One	21
Two or more	9

% of questionnaires (n = 90)	% of those who visited a museum at least once (n = 27)
23	78
7	22
	(n = 90)

FREQUENCY OF MUSEUM PROGRAMS AT SCHOOLS

Teachers were also asked which museums or cultural institutions came to their school so far this year to provide a program for their students. Many said there were no museum-led programs at the school for students (81 percent), several said their school hosted one museum program (16 percent), and a few said their school hosted two or more museum programs (3 percent). Few art museums hosted a program at the school.

MUSEUM PROGRAMS

Frequency of school visits by any type of museum far this year	% of questionnaires (n = 90)
None	81
One	16
Two or more	3

Were any of these school visits by an art museum?	% of questionnaires (n = 17)
No, not an art museum	88
Yes, visited by an art museum	12

TEACHER INTERVIEWS

TEACHER INTERVIEW GUIDES

CLASSROOM TEACHER INTERVIEW A

Thank you so much for speaking with me today. I will be audio recording our conversation so that I do not miss anything important.

- 1. From my notes I understand that you teach [x] for students in grade(s) [x]. Is that correct?
- In what ways is art a part of your classroom teaching? And I am interested in hearing about art making experiences as well as looking at and talking about works of art. [Probe accordingly for art teacher versus non-art teacher.]
- Prior to your recent visit to the x museum with your students, have you taken your students on an art museum field trips before?
 - [If yes to Q3]: What did you hope your students would get out of an art museum experience?
 - b. [If no to Q3]: What has prevented you from visiting an art museum with your students before? Your honesty is appreciated.
- In your opinion, what is the value of art museum visits to your students? How is that valuable to your students? Which aspects of the art museum visit are most valuable to your students?
- What, if any, expectations do you have for what students should do on a visit to an art museum? Can you tell me more about that?
- 6. Now, I'd like to ask you some questions specifically about your visit to the x Museum. First, what did you like most about that visit for your students?
- What about that visit did not work well for your students?
- What do you think your students took away from their experiences at the museum?
- What might you have hoped students would take away from that experience that they did not?
- 10. Do you have any other feedback to share about art museum visits or your recent visit to x museum



CLASSROOM TEACHER INTERVIEW B

Thank you so much for speaking with me today. I will be audio recording our conversation so that I do not miss anything important.

- 1. From my notes I understand that you teach [x] for students in grade(s) [x]. Is that correct?
- In what ways is art a part of your classroom teaching? And I am interested in hearing about art making experiences as well as looking at and talking about works of art. [Probe accordingly for art teacher versus non-art teacher.]
- Have you taken your students on art museum field trips before?
 - [If yes to Q3]: What did you hope your students would get out of an art museum experience?
 - [If no to Q3]: What has prevented you from visiting an art museum with your students before? Your honesty is appreciated.
- In your opinion, what is the value of art museum visits to your students? How is that valuable to your students? Which aspects of the art museum visit are most valuable to your students?
- What, if any, expectations do you have for what students should do on a visit to an art museum? Can you tell me more about that?
- Now, I'd like to ask you some questions specifically about the program led by the x Museum in your classroom. First, what did you like most about that visit for your students?
- What about that visit did not work well for your students?
- What do you think your students took away from their experiences in that program?
- What might you have hoped students would take away from that experience that they did not?
- 10. Do you have any other feedback to share about art museum visits or the recent visit by x museum to your classroom?

Again, thank you so much for speaking me. Your input is very helpful.

CLASSROOM TEACHER INTERVIEW C

Thank you so much for speaking with me today. I will be audio recording our conversation so that I do not miss anything important.

- 1. From my notes I understand that you teach [x] for students in grade(s) [x]. Is that correct?
- In what ways is art a part of your classroom teaching? And I am interested in hearing about art making experiences as well as looking at and talking about works of art. [Probe accordingly for art teacher versus non-art teacher.]
- 3. Have you taken your students on art museum field trips before?
 - [If yes to Q3]: What did you hope your students would get out of an art museum experience?
 - [If no to Q3]: What has prevented you from visiting an art museum with your students before? Your honesty is appreciated.
- In your opinion, what is the value of art museum visits to your students? How is that valuable to your students? Which aspects of the art museum visit are most valuable to your students?
- What, if any, expectations do you have for what students should do on a visit to an art museum? Can you tell me more about that?
- 6. Do you have any other feedback to share about art museum visits?

Again, thank you so much for speaking me. Your input is very helpful.

CONSENT FORM

See consent form for teacher questionnaire; interview consent was combined.

MUSEUM FACILITATOR INTERVIEWS

MUSEUM FACILITATOR INTERVIEW GUIDE

Thank you so much for speaking with me today. I am going to audio record our conversation so I don't miss anything important.

- How did you become interested in art museum teaching?
- How long have you been facilitating single-visit programs for K-12 students in art museums, for the x museum or otherwise? And by single-visit, I mean a program or tour where students come to the museum one time to look at original works of art. Can you tell me about that?
- What training have you had to facilitate single-visit programs for students? What kind of training has been most helpful?
- 4. What is the most enjoyable part of facilitating a single visit for K-12 students an art museum?
- What is the hardest part?
- 6. In your opinion, what is the value of art museum visits to students, particularly those in grades 4-6? How is that valuable to students?
- 7. What are some strategies you use during your tours to support students in that way?
- 8. Have you ever taught in a school setting before? Any other setting? Can you tell me about those experiences?

Thank you again for speaking with me. It is very helpful to hear your perspective.

CONSENT FORM

Consent for Museum Educator Participation in Research Study – Interview





Project Title: NAEA/AAMD Impact of Art Museum

> Programs on Students Research Study Emily Holtrop, Museum Education

Principal Investigator: **Division Director**

National Art Education Association Organization:

You are being asked to volunteer to participate in an interview as part of a larger research study being conducted by Randi Korn & Associates, Inc. for the National Art Education Association (NAEA) and Association of Art Museum Directors (AAMD). Participation is voluntary. Please read this consent form and ask any questions that you may have before agreeing to participate.

Purpose of the Study

To explore the impact of art museum programs on children.

Procedures

If you agree to participate in this study, you will complete one audio-recorded telephone interview about art museum teaching practices. You will be 1 of up to 18 educators at 6 museums to participate in the interview. If you do not want to be audio-recorded, you cannot take part in this study.

Length of Participation

You will complete one telephone interview that will take about 30 minutes to complete. The person doing the interview can stop the interview at any time if they feel it is best for you or the study. At the end of the interview your participation in this study will end.

Risks and Discomforts

There are minimal risks involved in study participation. Many steps are being taken to keep your information as private as possible, but we cannot promise. Your name will not be used in any reports or presentations about the study.

Study Benefits

There are no direct benefits to you. Your participation will provide valuable insight to the effects of art museum programs. The study is of interest to art museums nationwide.

Confidentiality

Information will be kept as confidential as possible within the limits of the law. Research records will be stored securely and only approved researchers will have access to the records. Your information and study data will be kept in this manner until the study is completed and will then be destroyed. A report and presentations of the findings will not include information that will make it possible to

identify you. There are organizations that may inspect and/or copy research records for quality assurance and analysis. These organizations include the sponsoring company or its representatives, relevant governmental agencies, and the Institutional Review Board (IRB) that approved this study.

Cost and Compensation

There are no costs to you associated with your participation in this study. There is no compensation.

Voluntary Nature of Participation

Participation in this study is voluntary, meaning that the alternative to participation is to decline. If you withdraw or decline participation, it will not affect your employment and you will not be penalized or lose benefits or services to which you are otherwise entitled. If you decide to participate, you may decline to answer any questions.

Audio Recording of the Interview

To assist with accurate recording of your responses, the interview will be recorded on an audiorecording device. Your name will not be associated with this recording, and the recording will be destroyed after completion of the study. If you do not want to be audio-recorded, you cannot participate in this study.

If you have concerns or complaints about the research, or if you think you may have been harmed as a result of taking part in this study, you can contact:

Emily Holtrop, Principal Investigator

Museum Education Division Director, National Art Education Association

Phone: 513-639-2879 / Email: eholtrop@arteducators.org

If you have any questions about your rights as a research participant, concerns or complaints about the research and wish to talk to someone other than individuals on the research team or to offer input, you may contact Ethical and Independent Review Services (the IRB who reviewed this research for subject's rights) at 1-800-472-3241 or subject@eandireview.com.

You will be given a copy of this consent form for your records. If you are not given a copy, please request one from Emily Holtrop.

Statement of Consent

I have read the above information. I have asked questions and received satisfactory answers. My participation in the study involves completing one telephone interview. Please check one box below indicating whether you agree to participate in this study. You are not giving up any legal rights by signing this form.

☐ Yes, I agree to participate in this study and to be audio-recorded.	
☐ No, I do not agree to participate in this study.	

Participant Signature	Date
7:	
Printed Name	
Email Address (to schedule interview)	