

**Recommendations of the National Art Education Association
Task Force on Equity, Diversity and Inclusion
with Rationales**



March 12, 2019

Submitted by Wanda B. Knight, Chair, on behalf of the
National Art Education Association Task Force on Equity, Diversity and Inclusion

Task Force Recommendations With Rationales

1. Create a standing Equity, Diversity, and Inclusion Commission similar to the NAEA Research Commission to ensure the sustainability of the ED&I work already begun
GOAL(S): Organizational Vibrancy

Rationale: Research on for-profit organizations suggests that ad hoc diversity committees are generally charged with identifying basic remedial steps, overseeing diversity initiatives, and monitoring progress (Dobbin & Kalev, 2007). However, because there is no one-size-fits-all strategy for organizational growth through diversity, particularly at the senior level, “diversity initiatives must be carefully tailored to the organization, taking into account the mission, work products, current organizational culture, and demographics” (Beasley, 2017, p. 20). Therefore, if the leadership of an organization takes such input and responsibilities seriously, then it will establish a *permanent* Equity, Diversity, and Inclusion Commission that has long-term influence on increasing equity, diversity and inclusive representation throughout the organization and its affiliates.

2. Incorporate equity, diversity and inclusion concepts and principles throughout the NAEA School for Art Leaders (SAL)
GOAL(S): Learning; Community

Rationale: NAEA’s 21st-century flagship program, School for Art Leaders (SAL), provides participants with learning experiences and skills to successfully lead in any environment. Given the program’s commitment “to supporting art educators in their quest to excel as leaders,” equity, diversity and inclusion concepts and principles must permeate all aspects of the program, (including the experiential action learning modules) in order for current and future leaders to effectively advance NAEA ED & I priorities.

3. Provide incentives for replicating affinity-based leadership development of cohorts, utilizing the School for Art Leaders (SAL) model, across NAEA divisions, interest groups, and state affiliates, as a means to identify, support and develop underrepresented or under-recognized pools of creative talent or expertise.
GOAL(S): Community; Organizational Vibrancy

Rationale: Affinity groups can be progressive spaces that amplify voices that have been marginalized within an organization. Affinity groups cultivate inclusion and diversity in organizations by creating inclusive spaces for members that do not identify with the dominant culture of an organization.

Research shows that biases within organizations—ranging from intentional partiality to the negligent, baked-in, and structural favoritism when leadership and award appointments or nominations are traded only within small, familiar circles of colleagues—can have significant deleterious effects on the advancement and promotion potential of people of color and other marginalized groups by disadvantaging their access to resources and opportunities associated with mentoring for leadership (Roth, 2004). Moreover, research indicates that incentive structures that require cooperation based on perceived affinities produce results, as team membership becomes more salient than demographical or cultural differences. Leadership cohorts of self-identified affinity groups might feature multiple point of contacts (e.g., matching preservice college students 1:1 with prospective high school students in portfolio prep programming; or matching senior staff 1:1 with new staff in coaching pairs; or connecting senior faculty 1:1 with new tenure-track faculty in professional peer mentorships). Affinity-based leadership development cohorts should ideally promote *intersections* between multiple underrepresented or under-recognized identities within a field or discipline (e.g., Black women’s leadership cohorts; LGBT Asian cohorts; First generation international college student cohorts). Some points of mentorship contact might be informal and self-organized, while some points of contact should be structural and systemic (e.g., a new program that engages seniors or grad students in portfolio preparation with high school students who are part of similar underrepresented affinity groups). Drawing upon (Beasley, 2017), there needs to be incentives to expand the scale and influence of the successful NAEA School for Art Leaders model for preparing art educators in their quest to excel as leaders across all states, regions, and divisional levels.

4. Explore implications for amending the NAEA Constitution and Bylaws to permit each Interest Group to have a Delegates Assembly representative that has voting rights similar to state association affiliates.

GOAL(S): Community; Organizational Vibrancy

Rationale: According to section 8 of the NAEA Constitution and Bylaws, adopted in 1995 and revised in 2014 and revised again in 2017, the “Delegates Assembly **shall be composed of the presidents or elected representatives of each state/province art education association**. Operational procedures shall be determined by the Assembly. **Affiliated group representation, without vote, may be accommodated in the Delegates Assembly.** The Delegates Assembly shall be a recommending body for legislative and policy matters for the Association.” Officially recognized NAEA Interest Groups, many formed to work toward equity, diversity, and inclusion—such as the Women’s Caucus, Committee on Multiethnic Concerns, Caucus of Social Theory, and the LGBTQ Caucus—do not have voting rights regarding proposed position statements or other legislative or policy matters brought to the Delegates Assembly for recommendation to the NAEA Board of Directors. The Board of Directors includes Regional Vice Presidents and Division Directors. Divisions are “job-alike” interest groups of the membership organized by grade level groupings: elementary, middle, secondary, higher education, plus three other interest groups: preservice, supervision and

administration, and museum education. The “job-alike” structure of Divisions should be reconsidered to include ED&I structures that would include NAEA caucuses. NAEA archival research provides evidence that there has been a concerted effort by influential art educators to make sure caucuses (now referred to as “interest groups”) who organized around shared interests (beyond grade-level and geographical location) do not have a seat and vote at the NAEA table. It is time to change this legacy by revising the NAEA Constitution and Bylaws to grant Interest Groups representation with voting rights at the Delegates Assembly.

5. Infuse ED&I priorities into each Goal of the 2020-2025 NAEA Strategic Plan; develop a new sixth ED&I Goal to be added to the Goals Framework with its own priorities to center equity work within the NAEA community; and employ metrics to measure progress toward ED&I goals and objectives.

GOAL(S): Organizational Vibrancy; New ED&I Goal

Rationale: The current 2015-2020 strategic plan includes five areas of priority: Community, Advocacy, Learning, Research & Knowledge, and Organizational Vibrancy. While some priorities mention “diverse” needs and “access” in the statements, few areas of priority have explicit equity, diversity and inclusion goals.

NAEA would benefit from having a more explicit, integrated, strategic, association-wide approach to equity, diversity and inclusion efforts. A framework to foster equity, diversity and inclusion would provide a roadmap and help to organize action(s). The framework would also focus attention on a common understanding of equity, diversity and inclusion priorities, support long term change at various levels of the Association, and would improve the likelihood of sustainability. Employing strategic plan metrics to track progress develops a culture of accountability towards carrying out equity, diversity and inclusion priorities.

6. Provide ongoing equity, diversity, and inclusion professional development for the NAEA Leadership, including state leaders and the NAEA Board of Directors

GOAL(S): Learning; Organizational Vibrancy

Rationale: Organizational leaders play a critical role in creating equitable outcomes for all by undertaking initiatives aimed at informing equity, diversity and inclusion-focused policy and practice. As a consequence, key players within an organization should commit to developing their understanding of equity, diversity, and inclusion to determine how existing policies and practices create or perpetuate inequity.

This recommendation stems from data collected from Task Force research, during July 2018, to better understand how the NAEA Board of Directors, State Level Affiliates and other leaders within the NAEA community understand and approach equity, diversity, and inclusion work, and what they perceive as their professional development needs towards furthering the work.

7. Develop policy that includes, supports, and welcomes diversity (including invisible diversity). Policy based on Universal Design principles would ensure that the onus of responsibility for adaptation resides with NAEA rather than the marginalized individuals and groups the association seeks to include

GOAL(S): Organizational Vibrancy

Rationale: It is necessary to include, support, and welcome invisible populations that are made vulnerable to discrimination by disclosing marginalized identities. Transgender status and disability are examples of such identity markers. Barriers to the participation of these individuals in NAEA's physical and online spaces must be removed without requiring individuals to be made vulnerable by identifying themselves. This is the implementation of pluralism which is necessary to support successful diversity initiatives (Bezrukova, Jehn, & Spell, 2012; Weisinger, 2005).

Universal Design is a set of design principles invented by an architect and wheelchair user to take the onus of accommodation off of marginalized individuals and put the responsibility of creating accessible environments on society and organizations so that this labor can be shared equitably and not shouldered by the most vulnerable (Hamraie, 2017). The pluralistic inclusivity (Bezrukova, Jehn, & Spell, 2012) of Universal Design and consistent accountability (Bisoux, 2017) are both necessary for successful diversity, equity and inclusion initiatives.

8. Establish sliding scale registration for NAEA membership, NAEA conventions, and other areas to encourage underrepresented and underserved group participation

GOAL(S): Organizational Vibrancy

Rationale: There are both in-service and pre-service individuals within the field who are not able to fully contribute to the association due to budget constraints. What can NAEA do to increase economic access for art educators who don't have the means to participate on a larger scale? Consequently, the Histories working group distributed a survey to the NAEA membership to gather data concerning institutional support for NAEA members. The survey responses from 114 NAEA members, unsurprisingly, revealed a large portion of NAEA members face huge financial barriers to participation in NAEA endeavors. Further, the majority, 73.5%, reported they have abstained from participating in NAEA activities due to a lack of funding.

Only 18.4% of respondents reported receiving full funding for attending NAEA conventions and 66.4% of respondents had to cover the entire cost of their NAEA memberships out of pocket. At the same time, almost 80% of respondents reported spending more than 1 hour per month on unpaid NAEA activities. In its efforts to diversify boards, delegations, and other leadership and service positions, NAEA should examine the role that economics play concerning participation at various

levels (e.g., national, state, regional, etc.) in an attempt to find a way to break down financial barriers through the creation of an equitable economic structure (e.g., Income-based membership and convention fees, scholarships, NAEA membership waivers, affordable convention locations, and compensation for leadership service). This gesture on behalf of the NAEA is congruent with equitable practices that serve as a foundation for an effective, healthy, inclusive, and thriving organization.

9. Collect equity, diversity, and inclusion statistical data that incorporates demographics concerning NAEA award recipients, the selection committees, and the nomination committees; demographics of divisions, Delegates Assembly, and Interest Groups to ensure inclusionary NAEA policies, practices, and procedures
GOAL(S): Research and Knowledge; Learning

Rationale: NAEA has a long history of honoring high-performing art educators in all divisions, regions, states, and provinces. However, attendees at the annual NAEA awards ceremonies can discern easily that the majority of the awardees and those recognized and represented are disproportionately White women and men. Statistical data suggests an inequity in the distribution of NAEA awards, forms of recognition and areas of representation within the NAEA community.

10. Create and maintain an open source repository of materials that include high-quality resources for NAEA members to learn about ED&I concepts in order to build leadership capacity for furthering ED&I work within their communities
GOAL(S): Learning; Research & Knowledge

Rationale Art educators create, design, deliver, and evaluate the curriculum and determine the quality of experiences within their teaching contexts. Thus, art educators need to take responsibility for their own learning concerning equity, diversity, and inclusion among other areas. This education or reeducation consists of not only learning new things but also unlearning some of the old. Based on the implications of the data collected from a Task Force survey administered during the NAEA Leadership Conference (July 2018), the NAEA membership, in general, would benefit from NAEA resources that support their journey towards cultural competence within the framework of equity, diversity, and inclusion. A list of readings, resources, and other materials in the repository could serve as a catalyst for self-imposed professional development and purposeful knowledge building through offerings that draw attention to what might be researched and studied as it relates to equity, diversity and inclusion.

11. Offer leadership development and mentoring opportunities that are specific to marginalized and underrepresented groups (e.g., workshops, or targeted programming at the NAEA annual convention).
GOAL(S): Learning; Organizational Vibrancy

Rationale: A way to galvanize current marginalized professionals to participate in leadership positions is through mentoring. Mentoring is critical to retention, engagement, and a healthy talent pipeline. According to Kevin Howell (2017), mentoring programs make companies' leadership significantly more diverse. Michi Fu, et al (2009) indicate the initiative can be started by inviting or encouraging diversity delegates to submit a letter of interest. This letter is intended to be a commitment from these individuals that they will follow through with the mentoring professional development.

Michi Fu also suggests that prominent leaders of color in the field should organize and facilitate the training. The goals of the workshop could include the exploration of leadership styles and knowledge about strategies to move into leadership positions. There should also be a balance of personal reflection, didactics and interactive discussions. This mentoring of prospective leaders could begin with current NAEA members of color and could start at the state level.

12. Develop a NAEA Political Action Committee that generates NAEA statements in response to acts of violence or acts of injustice that impact teaching and learning (e.g., mass school shootings); and create a system of support for NAEA members who have been subjected to violence or injustice (as an upstander or otherwise) within their professional communities

GOAL(S): Community; Advocacy

Rationale: High profile violence or social injustice can cause concern within educational communities, even if certain communities are not directly impacted by particular events. Students, teachers, parents, and others within educational communities strive to understand why these events happen, and more importantly, how they can be avoided. NAEA can provide visible leadership by creating a communication system to respond to prominent events that adversely impact teaching and learning communities.

13. Seek vendors/partners from underrepresented groups

GOAL(S): Community; Organizational Vibrancy

Rationale: Large corporations are usually owned and operated by White men (and women). Equity, diversity and inclusionary practices would behoove NAEA to be intentional in seeking and supporting vendors/partners from underrepresented business owners. While diversity in sponsorship may require more work in obtaining medium and small business support, building professional relationships with corporations, that transcend monetary transactions, would be a more equitable and inclusive practice for NAEA.

14. Create a series of programs to recruit underrepresented art education professionals into the field of art education

GOAL(S): Community; Organizational Vibrancy

According to the data mining of the Demographics Sub-Group, most NAEA members are white female teachers between 31 and 40. This strongly suggests that there is a lack of diversity in NAEA membership which ultimately impacts the leadership. In order to bring about change, we need to find ways to encourage marginalized individuals to not only participate in NAEA, but to also join the leadership team. Members of color need to have someone who looks like them in the administration (Guzman, 2009). If most of the NAEA membership consists of white women, then role models of color are lacking. This actually mirrors what is happening nationwide in the teaching profession where only 20% of the teacher workforce are individuals of color (Carver-Thomas, 2018).

The rationale for this recommendation is specifically related to creating sustainable practices that recruit and retain young professionals within the field. The retention and recruitment practices planned and developed must align with NAEA's strategic priorities to leverage NAEA as a professional organization that supports a long-term vision of ED&I work in bringing in, building, and supporting leaders that will embody ED&I practices. Art education scholars have identified research, surrounding a cohesive need to better understand the field and demographics (Galbraith, Grauer, Zimmerman) within art education, providing opportunities to explore how young professionals are recruited and retained within education as a whole.

15. Develop a means to welcome and socialize new members into the NAEA community

GOAL(S): Community; Organizational Vibrancy

Rationale: When new members join an organization, it is important to welcome them and make them feel included. Strategic approaches to acquaint new members with the NAEA community might include an email or other form of acknowledgement of the new membership; a welcome pack of information (electronic or otherwise) that identifies what they can expect from the association and how they might participate in the association through networking and connections with someone with similar interests; creating networking opportunities at conventions and during teleconference sessions; holding special events for new members, and other means.

New members represent an important group within the NAEA community. Their first year affords the association the best opportunity to lay a foundation for continuing loyalty.

Recommendation Outside the Purview of the NAEA Board of Directors

16. Create a new senior leadership position, Chief Diversity Officer, with the holder of this position reporting directly to the Executive Director, equivalent to other members of the Executive Leadership Team, in order to ensure the position has broad authority, influence, and responsibilities.

GOAL(S): Community; Learning; Advocacy; Research and Knowledge; Organizational Vibrancy

Rationale: Excluding the Executive Director of the National Art Education Association, there is no one within the NAEA leadership ranks who takes full responsibility for developing a unified sense of community concerning equity, diversity and inclusion across the association. Ad hoc diversity committees or task forces like NAEA's new ED&I Task Force were the most common initiative taken by the environmental nongovernmental organizations (NGOs) and foundations researched in a recent study by Maya A. Beasley (2017) titled *Beyond Diversity: A Roadmap to Building an Inclusive Organization*. According to Beasley (2017) the charge given to the diversity committees and task forces reported by study participants was typically the LEAST developed aspect of these initiatives, focused on identifying remedial steps, overseeing diversity initiatives, and monitoring progress while placing almost *no emphasis* on the importance of diversity in senior leadership. To move beyond remediation towards a strategic plan for increasing diversity, equity, and inclusion, experts in management and organizational development "have consistently contended that if an organization intends to accomplish a goal, it must make someone responsible for doing so" (Beasley, 2017, p. 15).

Organizations are increasingly creating roles such as chief diversity officers, diversity managers, educational administrators, and/or other professionals that can transform their professional communities and create a cultural shift that advances an equity, diversity and inclusion agenda. Moreover, research indicates that designated diversity staff, such as a diversity manager or a chief diversity officer, have a greater impact than do diversity plans by themselves. However, research also shows that standing diversity task forces or committees, ones comprised of division leaders from across an organization, have even stronger effects on overall organizational diversity than does the presence of a diversity manager or chief diversity officer alone (Dobbin & Kalev, 2007).